

Evaluation Report

Project No. B-BGD-1106-0002

PROJECT TITLE:

***Rokkhagola* Village Based Sustainable Food Security Program
for the Ethnic Community in Rajshahi**

Project Period: January 2013 – December 2014

Submitted to

Bread for the World (BftW), Germany

Submitted by

Centre for Capacity Building of Voluntary Organizations (CCBVO)

Rajshahi-6205, Bangladesh

August 30, 2014

Evaluator

**Dr. Md. Elias Hossain (Consultant)
Professor, Department of Economics,
University of Rajshahi, Bangladesh**

Assisted by

**Md. Khairul Islam (Member)
Lecturer, Department of Economics,
University of Rajshahi, Bangladesh**

CONTENT

Subject	Page No.
Executive Summary	3
Background	8
National and Local Contexts, and CCBVO's Intervention	8
Purpose of Evaluation	10
Objective of the final evaluation	10
Evaluation Approach	11
Methodology of Evaluation	11
Logical output of the project	11
Study design and sample selection	13
Method of data collection	13
Technique of data analysis	14
Demographic and Socio-Economic Features of the Ethnic Community People in the Project Intervention Area	15
Analysis of Rokkhagola Organization	19
Analysis of Ethnic Peoples Access to Government Services	21
Analysis of Ethnic peoples' Culture and Heritage	22
Other Issues of Development of the Ethnic Communities	23
Analysis of Focus Group Discussion and Key Informant Interviews	24
Issues addressed in the Focus Group Discussion	24
Outcomes the FGDs	25
Outcomes from Key Informant Interviews	28
Strength, Weakness, Opportunities and Threats Analysis	28
Analysis of the Impacts of the Project	29
Impacts on Socio-economic Condition	29
Impact on Health and Education	30
Impact on Governance and Leadership	31
Impacts on Culture and Heritage	31
Impact on Women Empowerment	32
Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness and Sustainability of the Project	32
Findings and Recommendations	33
Conclusion	37

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Centre for Capacity Building of Voluntary Organizations (CCBVO) is a non-profit social development and research organization incepted in 1999 in Rajshahi district for socio-economic development and empowerment of the rural poor people who are the most vulnerable in the society, especially the ethnic minorities/ indigenous people living in the Barind Tract of Rajshahi district. The goal of the Organization is to establish the rights of the poor and indigenous people through improving their lives and livelihood, where food security of the ethnic people is the prime objective among the others. Several indigenous people live in since immemorial period in Rajshahi and its adjacent districts in different clan identities like Santal, Rajoar, Pahang, Rai, Oraon, Rajbongshi, Hazra, etc. These people are presently facing many problems of which food insecurity, lack of access to health, education and legal services are worth to mention. CCBVO has prioritized the food crisis of these people and planned to develop capacities for these groups in solving the food problem. Through searching information about these communities, the organization rediscovered a very early existed practice by the indigenous groups of this region called *Dharmagola* – a place where they gathered and stored food grains to use for religious purposes. CCBVO has popularized this concept to the indigenous people to use it to solve their food crisis along with other problems.

Towards this objective CCBVO has started an action research for the indigenous communities named “*Rokkhagola: Village based Sustainable Food Security*” with an initial financial support of Bangladesh Freedom Foundation. By 2011 CCBVO has established *Rokkhagola* organization in 16 villages inhabited by the indigenous communities. To continue this effort, CCBVO has sought further support from Bread for the World, Germany, and taken another project called “*Rokkhagola Village based Sustainable Food Security Program for the Ethnic Community in Rajshahi*”. CCBVO has been implementing this project by extending more 10 villages and at present 26 villages in 2 unions of Godagari Upazila of Rajshahi district since January 2013. The targeted distressed and deprived ethnic communities are Santal, Oraon, Paharia, Rai, Rajoar and Hazra, who are in the process of building their own capacity to protect themselves from food crisis by forming Rokkhagola village based organization and constructing Rokkhagola house with the facilitation of CCBVO. The first phase of this project will come to be closed in December, 2014. The project contributed to build community organizations that are able to provide senses of membership to all the age groups and women by declaring and involving all of them in the community as general members of the village organization. The impact of the institution building is clearly visible on the enhancement of leadership capacity as the committees are active to undertake economic, social and cultural activities. The increased capacity of fund management, handling of bank account and undertaking other economic activities are clearly indicating the enhanced leadership capacity. One of the crucial impacts is evident in their monthly meeting agenda that they are engaged in dispute resolution, problem solving and dealing with community conflict management. The reorganization of community institutions has impact of undertaking new form of social and cultural activities. One of the significant impacts of the community organization building is the creation of scope for the women to take part in the committees therefore, in decision making process, initiated and recognized an equal status of men and women that is challenging the patriarchal gender stereotype. The position in village organization promoted and enhanced the leadership capacity of women leaders.

However, it is to be mentioned that the documentation was a little bit weak, especially the implementation process and learning from the experience of both facilitators and community was not systematically documented that could have been useful materials for participatory and people centered process.

The concept of knowledge is almost nonexistent. The project could have generated and documented good practices, achievements and challenges. The valuable learning from the project should be reflected upon and compiled for wider circulation. As a part of the project the necessity of an evaluation carried out by the consultant is inevitable and, therefore, this evaluation has been conducted to find out the impacts of the project.

Demographic and Socio-Economic Features of the Ethnic Community People

For the evaluation of the *Rokkhagola* project, the evaluation team has focused on the socio-economic condition of the ethnic communities in the project intervention area and tried to highlight the features

such as population, family size, age, education, occupation and ownership of land assets of the ethnic people. In these villages, there are 1105 families living with an average family size of 4.9 persons. Thus, the total population coverage by the 26 organizations is 5665 of which 2860 are male population and 2805 are female population. Around 98.3% households are headed by male persons. These villages are inhabited by people of seven ethnic communities, namely, Santals, Oraon, Rajwar, Rai, Paharia, Sing and Hajra. There are 1198 Oraon people living in the project area who comprise 25.68% of the total population covered by the project. There are 17.66% Rajwar people and 14.13% Santal people living in the study area. Other ethnic groups are Paharia, (7.97%), Rai (5.51%), Hajra (4.41%), and Sing (3.53%) in the project intervention area.

During the survey, information on the age of the household members was collected. It is observed that according to age the largest proportion of people fall in the age range 16 years to 30 years. 22.2% population fall in this age group. It is found that people of age 60 years and above is only 3.1% indicating the fact that ethnic people has lower expectancy of life compared to the average life expectancy of the people of Bangladesh. The rate of dependency in the project intervention area is 475, which means that in 1000 people in the study area 475 people are dependent. These people are dependent on the rest 520 people.

Educational status of the family members involved with *Rokkhagola* village based organization shows that 34% of the ethnic population has no education, of which 22.7% can only sign their names and 11.3% cannot sign their names even. Among those who are educated have also very lower level of education as 26.6% of whom have only primary school education followed by 23.4% people who are literate with education in between class six to class nine. People with higher level of education such as HSC or graduation and above comprise of only 2.6% of the total population.

When educational status of the household heads was investigated, it is found that educational status of the sample household heads is very low. They are mostly found to be illiterate or have the ability to sign their names. 40.4% of the household heads under the survey can only sign their names.

It is seen that literacy rate (defined as the rate of education of people of age 6 years and above) in the ethnic community people in the project area is very low compared to the general scenario of Bangladesh. Rate of literacy is 54.9% in the ethnic people which are lower than the literacy rate at national level (58%). However, the situation has been changed and these people are gradually becoming aware about the education of their children. This is seen by the fact that 92.2% of the children of age 6 to 11 years are now enrolled in primary schools. As long as gross enrollment is concerned, it is seen that the rate is 79.75% in relation to the age group from 6 years to 24 years. However, it is found that drop out of children from school is also high in the ethnic populations, as the school discontinuation rate is 13.5%.

As causes of drop out it is reported that 4.9% children cannot understand Bengali language at the initial stage of schooling for which they do not find interest to go to school, whether 19.3% children cannot fare well in school because they cannot absorb the lessons of the school given in the medium of Bengali, English and arithmetic. The most common reason came out in the opinions of the respondents is that parents cannot afford educational expenses which compels 55% children to stop going school. As far as other reasons for dropout are concerned, it is found that in 4.5%, 1.9%, 5.8% and 60.4% cases children are dropped out from school because of discrimination against ethnic children, child marriage, child labour, and lack of awareness of parents, respectively.

It is seen that the average monthly income of the sample ethnic households is only Tk. 4148.74 with maximum Tk. 8000.00 and minimum Tk. 2000.00 per month. It is also found that due to low level of income ethnic people are unable to grow savings as they have to spend almost the whole income for buying the daily 3986.22 with Tk.7750.00 as maximum expenditure and Tk. Tk. 2200.00 as the minimum expenditure.

Most of the ethnic people in the project intervention area do not possess any land to cultivate while there are some marginal farmers who possess one, two or three *bighas* of land. The people, who have no land, work in other's land as farm labourer to earn income. It is observed that 55.8% respondents are involved as labourer. 15.4% are marginal farmers while 16.4% households heads are involved with both farming at marginal scale and also serving as farm labourer when complete their own farming works. The average number of earning persons in the respondent families is 2.42.

The distribution of ethnic population by holding land asset in the project conducting area shows that there is 67.3% sample respondents who have no cultivable land and 30.5% households have no homestead. On the other hand, there are only 20.7% households who have some land to cultivate. The households who have land of their own are also very small in quantity. From the field level study it is found that among these 32.7% respondents 14.5% have only 1 to 33 decimal land, 8.5% have 34 to 66 decimal land and 9.7% have above 66 decimal land. It is also shown that 69.5% respondents have homestead land only and of them 13.2% have only 1 to 5 decimal land and 34.6%, 5.3%, 66.% and 9.7% have 6-10 decimal, 11-15 decimal, 16-20 decimal, and 20+ decimal land, respectively. 15% of the respondents of the ethnic communities benefit from *khas* land mostly for their homestead and 22.9% households do agriculture as share croppers.

Although some ethnic families have own cultivable land and homestead land, the size of their land is very small. The average size of cultivable and other land owned by respondent families is shown in 10A. It is observed that average land per family is only 13.16 decimal. The average size of homestead land is 7.11 decimal and average size of cultivable and other land is 14.72 decimal.

Ethnic people in the project intervention area have only a few assets as they are very poor. It is shown that 92.5% ethnic households who were interviewed during the sample survey, have bi-cycle which is used as transport for their personal movement and only 6.0% households have motorcycle for that purpose. It is found that 70.0% households have TV/Radio/Cassette players as recreational instrument. 1.2% ethnic households have rickshaw/van which they used to earn income in their daily life. Power tiller is used to plough land which is a valuable asset also. It is observed that 12.5% households have power tiller. Mobile phone is important means for communicate with others. and 62.5% ethnic households have mobile phones.

At present ethnic households rear hens, ducks, cows, goats, sheep etc. at home. A few also culture fish in ponds. They also plant tree at their house. It is found that ethnic people were mostly found to have cattle, hens, ducks, pigeons at their homes. Among the 104 households, 62 (61%) households were found to have either hens or ducks or both at their homes. On the other hand, 83 household (80%) have cattle at their homes. Besides rearing poultry and cattle, some families rear goat/ sheep (64%) and some are found to involve in fish culture (16%). It is found that 62% families have planted trees at their home. Ethnic households grow vegetables at their homestead and some have tress at their homestead It is revealed that 86.2% families grow vegetables at their homestead and 49.8% have tress at their homestead. Regarding the condition of houses it is shown that 92.3% houses are made of mud walls with tin shades. However, some people who cannot afford to buy tin, have houses with mud walls and grass roofs. Only 1.9% respondents have *pucca* wall and tin shade house and no households has concrete *pucca* house.

Analysis of Rokkhagola Organization

The evaluation team depicts the features and characteristics of the *Rokkhagola* social organization, the activities under it and the outputs of the activities. It is found that on the average, each *Rokkhagola* organization has 42.5 member families with highest 62 families in the village Pathorghata and Beldanga, and the lowest 19 families in the village Nimghutu. It is also found that on the average 7.7 families are remaining outside the *Rokkhagola* organization.

The *Rokkhagola* organizations have specific manuals for functioning. There is a general body of the organizations consisting of all the member households. To run the function main responsibility is given to its executive committee who take all the decisions about the organization. Under the executive committee there are some subcommittees such as health subcommittee, education sub-committee etc. It is found that Average number of general members (persons) and executive members per *Rokkhagola* are 218 and 9. Executive committee consists of both male and female members. Average male member and female member in executive committee per *Rokkhagola* are 5 and 4. All *Rokkhagola* social organizations have health, education, security and cultural committees. Each *Rokkhagola* arrange two meeting per month. In general meetings per month at least 75% members attend. Again, in the meeting of executive committee 80% members attend regularly. *Rokkhagola* house is the symbol of the organization. It is found that all of the 26 organizations have their own *Rokkhagola* house, the house is completely built in 23 villages while in 3 villages the work will be completed by December 2014.

It is found that according to 92% respondents' opinion general meeting holds regularly while according to only 8% respondents general meeting does not hold regularly. 100% reported that meeting of executive holds regularly.

Through the *Rokkhagola* organization the villagers save food, paddy and sometimes money for their food security and other purposes. Generally, each family saves rice in weekly basis at a rate of 0.5 Kg. or 1 kg. Besides, rice the save paddy at a rate of 5 kg per season. One of the major problems of ethnic households is that they do not have sanitary latrine. Therefore, the members of some *Rokkhagola* deposits Tk. 5.00 per week to be able to build latrine. It is observed that 98.5% families deposit 0.5 Kg. of rice per week and only 3.5% families deposit 1 Kg. of rice per week. It is found that 8.5% respondent deposits money for making latrine.

Ethnic people have been depositing rice and paddy in the *Rokkhagola* house in weekly and season basis, respectively, to achieve food security. After certain time they sell saved rice and paddy and deposit money in banks because rice and paddy may be damaged if these are remained in the *Rokkhagola* house for long time. They deposit the money in banks which received by selling rice and paddy. This information is preserved in the organizations and CCBVO documents. It is revealed that total deposit of rice in 26 *Rokkhagola*, as per the records stood at 96,456.5 Kgs. in 2013 and it increased to 125,389.5 Kgs. in 2014. On the other hand the total amount of paddy in 26 *Rokkhagola* was 16,520 Kgs. in 2013 and it increased to 20,626 Kgs. in 2014. On the other hand total amount of money deposits in bank is Tk. 768115.00 and total amount of cash in hand is Tk. 172693.

Most of the members of *Rokkhagola* save rice and paddy regularly. It is found that 86% families saved rice in *Rokkhagola* regularly, 8% families sometimes cannot save rice every week and but they save it in next week. There are another 4% families which cannot deposit rice in one or two weeks but save within one month and only 2% families' deposit rice after one month. It is also found that 100% families deposit paddy in due time.

One of the main objectives of saving of rice, paddy and money in the *Rokkhagola* organization is to enable its members to get assistance from those stock of rice and paddy, and stock of money during their needs in the lean seasons. It is found from the field survey that members of *Rokkhagola* organizations widely taken rice assistance from *Rokkhagola* during food crisis and also at the time of family occasions such as marriage or funeral rite. Members also took money assistance from the organization to meet up the education expenses and treatment expenditures during ailments. It is found that 95.7% respondents have taken rice, 9.9% respondents have taken money and only 0.7% respondent has taken paddy as assistance.

According to reports of the respondents, among the families have taken rice assistance from the *Rokkhagola* organization, highest 51.1% taken 21 kg to 40 kg of rice as assistance. 24.0% families taken 40 Kg or more rice which 20.6 % families taken in between 11Kg to 20Kg of rice as assistance. In the case taking money assistance from the *Rokkhagola*, it is learnt that most families take support an amount of money less than 10,000 taka.

Analysis of Ethnic Peoples Access to Government Services

Although Bangladesh is a poor country, the government has been providing many supports for the betterment of the poor people living in the rural area. However, due to inability and lack of awareness ethnic people seldom avail these supports provided by the people to cater to the rural area of the country. Ethnic people suffer from different types of diseases and 93% families of the ethnic communities suffered from at least disease in last one year. It is also shown that 88.1% families suffered from cold/fever, 33.1% suffered from skin disease, 67.8% suffered from dysentery, 71.2% suffered from diarrhea, 45.5% suffered from jaundice, 60.8% suffered from gastric and 9.9% families suffered from other diseases.

When suffered from diseases, ethnic people received treatment from different sources such as medical hospital, Upazila health complex, private hospital or clinic, drug shops, village doctor, homeopathy doctor etc. It is found that 34.3% respondents reported that they receive treatment from Rajshahi medical hospital while 17.6% respondents reported that they take treatment from upazila health complex. Besides government hospital and health complex they also go to private hospital, private clinic and NGO clinic to take treatment (10.7%).

Union Parishad is the door step agency from which services can be availed easily. During the survey, 94% respondents reported that they went to the Union Parishad in last one year for taking service. The purpose for which ethnic people went to the Union Parishad are- birth registration, issue of national ID card, certificate for cattle, disputes with others, etc. According their opinion, chairman and members of the union parishad pays good attention on the needs although in some cases they misbehave with the people of the ethnic communities. During the survey, people were asked about their connection with the upazila level offices. Only a few respondents reported that they went to the upazila level offices in last two years. Most of them go to the land office, fishery office etc.

Analysis of Ethnic peoples' Culture and Heritage

Ethnic people in the project intervention area have their own language, culture and religion. During the survey, investigation was done to identify the kinds of social and religious cultural functions are observed by the ethnic people. It is found that Monsa puja, Durga puja, Laksmi puja, Kali puja, Swarosati puja, Jonmastomy etc. are the religious occasions observed by the ethnic people who follow traditional religion. There are some ethnic people who follow Christianity and they observe Christmas and Ester Sunday. There are some social events such as Baha, Fagua, Karam, Nabanna etc. which are observed by all. Ethnic people in the project area are found to observe various days such as the Adivasi day, Birsha Munda day, Sidhu-Kanu day etc.

In observing the above religious and social festivals the ethnic people generally organize cultural functions consisting of songs, dances, foods etc. They also organize cultural events in the village. During the time of marriage ceremony of their children and at the time of death funerals they do some rituals collectively.

During the survey, focus was given to look into the level of awareness of the ethnic people about preserving their culture and tradition. It is found that ethnic people are gradually getting aware about own culture and heritage. It is revealed that 85% ethnic people understand that many of the traditional culture are in extinction now. 72% opined that there are many food items used to be eaten by their early generations which are not being eaten now. However, the ethnic people are of the opinion that after the functioning of the Rokkhagola organization many of the traditional cultural activities are getting revived and people are becoming more aware about their own culture and heritage.

Impacts, Findings and Recommendation

It is found that the Rokkhagola project has result in many visible impacts on the live and livelihoods of the ethnic people. The areas where positive impacts observed are – achievement of food security, improvement of socioeconomic condition of the people, positive impact on health and education, enhancement of governance and leadership, conservations of ethnic culture and heritage and promotion of women empowerment. Analyses based on household survey, focus group discussion, and key informant interview revealed that 'Rokkhagola Project' under the CCBVO is a success story, although in some cases the progress is found slow. As per CCBVO's overall development goal, this type of project can be treated as an opportunity for improving strategies and ways in implementing the development programs for the ethnic people. It is seen that the Rokkhagola project has been implemented nicely as per the plan. Based on the findings of the final evaluation, it is recommended that besides the ongoing activities of the organization, additional aspects of food security and earnings related issues should be emphasized within the framework of Rokkhagola organization. Moreover, issues like facilitation of market networking, further empowerment of women, investment of the deposited assets in riskless sectors, and food security in terms of ensuring nutritious food etc. must be considered as new intervention areas by the CCBVO. Lastly, CCBVO must expand the formation of Rokkhagola organizations in other villages as many people from other villages eagerly want such organizations in their place.

BACKGROUND

As a development and research organisation Centre for Capacity Building of Voluntary Organisation (CCBVO) has developed the concept of Rokkhagola through a social study on livelihood and problems of ethnic communities live in Northwest part of Bangladesh. Since 2001, CCBVO has devoted quite a long time to form the concept of Rokkhagola in a participatory way together with the indigenous people by receiving their inputs through arranging workshops and discussions. The main theme of discussion in these events was ‘identification of the causes or reasons behind the problems and obstacles in the indigenous locations and the means and strategies of solution of the concerned problems’. A significant number of indigenous people were interacted through this process, who expressed their conditions and opinions about the problems and pointed possible way outs. These indigenous people have their own social customs, culture, language and different physical attributes and they can be distinctly identified for their ethnic characteristics. From interaction with them four main problems were identified as i) social: breaking down of social unity and weak social organization and lack of social security, ii) economic: poverty, high interest rate of credit, food and drinking water insecurity and unemployment, iii) political: less opportunity and less participation in politics and iv) cultural: their culture is under threats and losing of religious cultural properties. The root causes of these problems are described in most cases are lack of initiatives, skills, policies and some local actors like land grabbers, touts, terrorists etc. The organisation has piloted the project since 2003 to 2005 in five selected villages and further, which has been continued up to 2011 with the assistance of Bangladesh Freedom Foundation (BFF) in 16 villages.

The present phase of the project namely Rokkhagola Village Based Sustainable Food Security Program for the Ethnic Community in Rajshahi has been started since January, 2013 with the assistance of Bread for the World (BftW) which has been considered for evaluation. The first phase of this project will come to close in December, 2014.

Geographically the project has expanded and covered total 26 villages and involved more indigenous peoples, 1 like, Santal, Oraon, Rajwar, Rai, Paharia, Sing, Hajra (Dalit) live in the following villages, Choitonnapur, Nimkuri, Shahanapara, Pathorghata, kntapasha-Idolpur, Beldanga, Golai, Jiolmary, Gordaing, Mulkidaing, Daingpara, Nimghutu, Shreerampur, Baganpara, Gonakardaing, Farshapara, Dadour, Gunigram-Rajapara, Edolpur, Norsingor-Adorsh-Gram, Agolpur, Udpur, Kamlapur-Bilpara, Muraripur, Sakura, Gogram under Deopara and Gogram Union of Godagari Upazila of Rajshahi district. Total 1105 families live in these villages and total population is 5665 (female 1630, girls 1203, male 1624, boys 1208).

CCBVO considers it as an effective approach to be mainstreaming which gives priority to food security by promoting Rokkhagola (Food grain store) in community centers (in a house one part is food grain store and another part is a large meeting room) and by encouraging communities to reorganize village level social organizations to carry out development initiatives based on Indigenous values, cultures and practices.

CCBVO accepted that development in the indigenous society means a continuing empowerment process in achieving socio-economic-political-cultural rights to preserve and flourish the indigenous society and the majority poor people thereof. Thus, CCBVO has given priority to food security by promoting Rokkhagola in village centers and by encouraging communities to reorganize village level social organizations to carry out development initiatives based on indigenous values, cultures and practices.

NATIONAL AND LOCAL CONTEXTS AND CCBVO'S INTERVENTION

Bangladesh is a least developed country in South Asia. The country has a total area of 147,570 square kilometers with a total population of around 160 millions. Bangladesh has a long glorious heritage of socio-cultural diversity and social harmony. Although around 98% of the people are Bengalis, the country is ethnically heterogeneous as the remaining population is ethnic minorities of various origins. According to the NCIP report there are around 3 million ethnic populations in Bangladesh who represent at least 75 ethnic communities. A significant fraction of these ethnic people live in Rajshahi district. Ethnic people of Bangladesh are in general not interested in politics and only a few of them participate in elections at national or local levels.

The socioeconomic condition of the people of Bangladesh is one of the least developed one and a significant proportion of the population live below poverty line and in the darkness of illiteracy. The socioeconomic conditions of the women in the country are very vulnerable compared to men and social constraints prohibit them to move forward rather than being kept in seclusion. Due to the domination of the business oriented and rich people, landless, sharecroppers and marginal farmers are deprived of basic opportunities coupled with unjust wage receive, diminishing purchasing capacity for agricultural inputs and inability to obtain institutional services.

Unemployment of a large proportion of labor force who mostly works in agriculture related activities is one of the major problems in the rural areas of Bangladesh. A sizable portion of them migrate to the city and town areas for work and they take refuge in the slums adding formidable social and health problems. Those who remain in the rural areas were getting paid very low wage and used to get exploited by the rural elites.

People of Bangladesh are by nature fond of democratic practices and norms. However, in the history of the country democracy mostly remained absent and mostly mean just to have voting power of the people which also sometimes people cannot apply due to local power structure. Public administrative bodies are mostly perceived by people not as friend but as ruler on them. Disappointing attitude among the people prevails due to incapacity of government authorities and dishonest politics. In such situations, using the religious sentiments fundamentalist groups and political groups with vested interest try to create unrest in different areas of the country.

Rajshahi is one of the economically backward districts is situated in the north-west part of Bangladesh. Godagari Upazila of Rajshahi district is the project intervention area of CCBVO. The operational area of CCBVO is confined in two unions i.e Deopara and Gogram, in 26 out of 110 tribal villages under Godagari Upazila, which are remote and under served. According to other reports published in 1986, in Rajshahi, population of the ethnic people was 120,005. On the basis of the reports the current estimated total ethnic population is (2010) about 201,760. Various communities of different ethnic origins have been living in Rajshahi district for ages. There are about 33 ethnic communities among which Santal, Oraon, Mundari, Mahali, Paharia, Mahato (Kurmi), Pahan, Sing, Rajowar, Rai, Hajra, Teli etc. are worth mentioning. Though the people of these ethnic sects with their own social tradition, culture, language and different physical attributes, live alongside the majority Bengalis, they can be identified easily for their distinct and different ethnic characteristics.

Rajshahi and its adjacent area are popularly known as Barind tract (region) which is the home of many ethnic tribes. The socio-economic condition of Barind region is worse than other areas of Bangladesh. The main occupation of the people in the Barind region is only rain fed agriculture. For centuries, this area of Barind had been producing paddy and is still the proud producer of very good and fine quality of rice. But ruthless activities of the people against nature reduced annual rainfall and hence crop production in this area. Thus, the area becomes one of the most backward and poverty stricken areas in the country.

Poverty and backwardness of the area has led to economic and occupational displacement for the people and subsequent loss of confidence. Not specialized in any other professional skills, the people could not fit themselves into the wider economic structure. Poverty exposed them to exploitation and made them vulnerable to many undesirable situations. The extreme poverty due to lack of systematic development strategy of the area reduced ethnic communities, into the most backward people in the country. Due to poverty and lack of employment thousands of people of this area remain jobless, live within inadequate calorie intake and come to the town for job, and they are exploited, cheated and harassed. The worst sufferers are the women folk of this area.

In this backdrop, CCBVO has come forward to bring about a significant change in the lives and livelihoods of these backward people. At the beginning, the project tried to address the following undesirable situations with a request to help them to live as human beings with dignity:

Most people of the project area as well as Barind tract region lived below the poverty line. Most of the ethnic families were dependent on agriculture and agriculture related occupations for their livelihood. In fact, many of them were tenants farmers and cultivated the land of others. Others were just day laborers to work mostly in agricultural fields. They remained unemployed at least for 6 months a year and used

to sell their labor at low wages. Unemployment and insecurity of daily diet were the most crucial phenomenon in the ethnic people. They faced severe food crisis in the rainy season. Under this situation, they were bound to borrow paddy or money from the local money lenders with a very high rate of interest for food, treatment and repairing house etc. Normally, they repaid their loan by selling their seasonal crops, which push them to extreme consequence on the lives and existence.

The ethnic people were mostly illiterate. They live in clan based communities. But social bondage and leadership was getting weakened day by day because of poverty compounded with limited knowledge about their rights. They were facing different disparities and torture in many ways. The land grabbers, terrorists, touts and communal evil forces oppressed them in various ways. They grab their properties by forgery, evict them from their dwelling places, torture the female members physically and mentally, etc. Food insecurity, violation of human rights, killing, torture, oppression from filing falls cases, rape etc. were the notable problems facing by the ethnic people in the area. Moreover, the ethnic communities were lagging behind in education. In the name of mainstreaming, their children faced a lot of challenges and hesitation in the schools due to unknown language, unknown topics and unfamiliar environment. They did not find any trace of their culture and custom. Eventually, they used to loss their confidence while competing with other students.

Unequal gender situation of the ethnic society was prevalent in the project area. Here women rights were suppressed by the male dominating family and society in terms of not allowing to participate in decision making in the family and get the same wages like men though they work harder than man.

Although the government was found to give special attention on development of the ethnic communities, However, ethnic people got little access to those government services due to lack of education and leadership.

PURPOSE OF EVALUATION

To address the above problems CCBVO has taken on the Rokkhagola project. In order to ascertain the extent of progress of planned activities and expected results however, the evaluation has been conducted mainly as indicator-based and efforts are given to find out the progress against target related to each approved indicator.

As per the design the CCBVO has implemented the activities through organizations in the name of Rokkhagola village community organisation developing the infrastructure for food security, improved awareness about the preservation of heritage and culture, enhanced knowledge of self management and also through increasing capacity to safeguard their rights. But the progress against indicators, success, challenges and lack thereof are not possible to examine during implementation through regular monitoring only. Thus there is a need of final evaluation towards the goal and objective of the project as well as looking into the relevance, effectiveness, impact of the project in view of changing the lives and livelihood of the ethnic people.

OBJECTIVE OF THE EVALUATION

There are some specific objectives of this evaluation which are as follows:

1. To assess the success of the project in achieving its set targets and indicators.
2. To examine and assess the appropriateness of the project design for achieving the set objectives of the project.
3. To assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the project management process including the implementation, monitoring and evaluation system followed by the project.
4. To assess the strengths and weaknesses of the project including competency of its staffs for the jobs assigned to them and for achieving the project objectives.
5. To identify the impact of the project on the target people as well as on the wider social context.

6. To assess the capacity of the management committee of *Rokkhagola* for both male and female developed to carry out the process initiated by the project on its continuation of its activities in the area.
7. To evaluate sustainability of the effects and impacts of the project in the wider environment.

Moreover, this evaluation will assess the progress towards the overall goal. It will identify how people's lives have been changed or transformed in both qualitative and quantitative terms. It looked into the progress towards reduction of vulnerability of the target community. The evaluation team would also pay special attention to change of awareness, knowledge, attitude and practices within the target communities. Finally, the evaluation team identified the lessons learned toward well management of the project, best practices and challenges/gaps and formulates actionable recommendations, which can be utilized to make CCBVO work in the program area more effective.

EVALUATION APPROACH

The approach of this study revolves around the objectives and scope of the work, which includes identification of key issues, statistical sample design, design of study, methods of data collection, data processing and analysis. The study critically assesses the outcome of the *Rokkhagola* project focusing on food security situation of project beneficiaries in relation to project expected outputs and also focusing impacts through analyzing different factors associated with food security, poverty alleviation Conceptual, women empowerment, cultural conservation issues. Thus, the study provides bases for policy decisions for continuation and expansion of CCBVOs ongoing project in the intervention areas.

METHODOLOGY OF THE EVALUATION

This evaluation of CCBVO's '*Rokkhagola* Village based Sustainable Food Security Program for the Ethnic Community in Rajshahi'- project has been carried out following a structured questionnaire and guidelines for FGD and key informants' interviews (KII) developed as per the objectives and purpose of this evaluation. For the study a total of 104 respondent households were taken as sample from the 26 villages where *Rokkhagola* social organizations are formed. In addition to the questionnaire survey, 10 FGDs with the members of the organization and 1 FGD with 9 key informants were conducted. All the collected data were processed using computer software packages and analyzed accordingly. Main highlights of the study findings are presented below.

This evaluation followed both quantitative and qualitative techniques to achieve the objectives. The study is conducted in four stages - (i) getting started and planning the process; (ii) data collection; (iii) analysis and interpretation; and (iv) presentation and dissemination of the findings.

The methodology of this evaluation also seeks to find the factors influencing the livelihood strategies of the ethnic community people, the impacts on the people of the activities under the *Rokkhagola* organization, impacts on the overall development of the region, achievement of the project in line with set objectives and activities of the project, and the measures needed to make the project success and sustainable.

LOGICAL OUTPUT OF THE PROJECT

The conceptual framework has developed considering the major objective of the project for assessing the performance and impact, and lack thereof. CCBVO has been seeking to achieve the setting objectives through intervention. The following table shows the logical output of the project:

Table 1: Logical Output of CCBVO's Rokkhagola Project		
Before Intervention	Interventions	After Intervention
People of ethnic villages in Rajshahi district lacked sustainable livelihood practices.	Initiatives taken to form <i>Rokkhagola</i> village based social organization to this end.	Gradually <i>Rokkhagola</i> village based organizations were established in 26 villages through which they are now working together for their sustainable development.
Community people were not united and integrated in the village in way to their own development.	System of collective decision making emphasized and trainings given by CCBVO.	Practice of taking decisions about problems increased and integrity among the ethnic people increased.
Women rights were suppressed and they were not allowed to participate in decision making	Provision of gender balancing emphasized in the functioning of Rokkhagola.	Ratio of women members in the Rokkhagola committee increased, they participated in decision making and perception of the society towards woman changed.
Ethnic people suffered from food insecurity and starved during the lean period. They did not make use of their homestead area for food security.	Rokkhagola house made; provision of food saving and mutual transaction system introduced through <i>Rokkhagola</i> , they were told about the benefits of homestead gardening and poultry-livestock rearing.	Ethnic people become food secured through saving and transaction of food. Most of them found to do homestead gardening and rearing of livestock and poultry.
Ethnic people faced disparities and torture by land grabbers, terrorists, touts and communal evil forces in many ways	Strategies suggested to them to face these problems collectively and in cohesive way; CCBVO provided direct help in some cases	Frequency of these problems has reduced considerably.
People had less access to union and upazila level offices, less school enrollment of the children.	Formation of different subcommittees under the Rokkhagola to work for health, education, security etc. CCBVO's assisted in this regard.	People became aware about their rights and services provisioned by government for them; their communication with Union and Upazila level offices increased; school enrollment has also increased.
Indigenous culture and language were neglected, less festivals observed	Cultural committee formed, made them understand the importance of conserving own culture and customs; musical instruments given by CCBVO	People becoming more aware of observing their and cultural festivals and rituals; their participation in the festival occasions increased, cultural functions found to be held.

STUDY DESIGN AND SAMPLE SELECTION

The evaluation of CCBVO's *Rokkhagola* project evaluation intends to determine the progress towards goal and result level indicators. Due to time limitation, this study could not deal with large sample which could be considered as more representative. Considering the time limitation and the size of the sampling frame a total of 104 respondents were interviewed for this evaluation study. These 104 sample respondents were distributed almost proportionately to 26 *Rokkhagola* social organizations. A structured questionnaire was used for collecting the data for quantitative analysis. For qualitative and in depth analysis, 10 FGDs were conducted of which 8 FGDs were general members and the rest two FGDs are with members of *Rokkhagola* executive committee. Moreover, an FGD of key informants including UP member, journalist, teacher, development worker etc. was conducted. In addition, special interviews with the officials at the Upazila levels are also taken.

METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION

The following data collection method has been proposed based on the expectation stated in the ToR and the deliverables to be produced by this study. The methodology is designed to prepare a framework for collecting primary data and information from all the relevant stakeholders and analyzing the information up to micro-level. The techniques of using each of the methods in the context of this study are discussed separately in the following paragraphs.

- (a) **Reviewing of Secondary Materials/Documents:** A thorough literature search has been conducted on the activities of CCBVO relating to weekly and monthly program management reports, annual monitoring reports, CCBVO's policy document, annual work plans, baseline report, financial report and budget, other reports/records etc. These secondary materials are collected from CCBVO office. Informal discussions are also carried out with responsible persons who provided information regarding various documents based on which other materials were collected.
- (b) **Visual Inspection:** The evaluation team members with the help of the CCBVO facilitators made sincere visits to the villages in the program intervention area, as this is an excellent way to become familiar with any particular situation. This onsite visual inspection has enabled the team members to see the *Rokkhagola* houses, to understand people's physical condition and activities; the services, vehicles facilities, marketing facilities of agricultural products and water and sanitation systems and hygiene practices by people, daily lives of women including their mobility and involvement in economic and social activities beyond the household tasks are observed, and visible impacts of the project activity on the lives of the ethnic people.
- (c) **Household Survey:** Household survey allows to gain information from a large number of people in a structured way according to specific questions, often in ways they allow for statistical analysis. The questions include structured set of closed questions as well as open-ended questions. Structured set of closed questions facilitated the evaluation team to analyze the data statistically, while open-ended or free-response questions proved to be particularly good for determining people's feelings and attitude. In this study, mostly fixed response questionnaires are applied except for few open ended questions. Major issues touched are household and demographic information, educational information, livelihood information, information about the function and activities of the *Rokkhagola* organization, saving of food and transaction of food, participation of ethnic people in the group activities, language, culture and heritage of the ethnic communities, health and hygiene condition, information on community problems, resource in the project areas and cross cutting issues such as violence against women and children, etc.
- (d) **Focus Group Discussion (FGD) with Villagers and Key Informants:** In assessing some critical issues and evolving acceptable suggestions for enhancing operational effectiveness, the evaluation team has planned to conduct the FGDs. FGDs are conducted to gather opinions of the general and executive committee members who are directly involved with the village organization under the *Rokkhagola* project. The focus of the discussions is primarily upon the issues, for which data can hardly be collected through the survey technique, particularly when in-depth information is needed. Participants were selected in order to ensure that they are able to provide credible information to the questions to be raised in the sessions. The facilitator uses a discussion guide and checklists are prepared. During the sessions of the FGDs, interaction among the participants was encouraged to stimulate in-depth discussion of various issues.

An FGD has also been carried out to gather information from the key informants who are considered to be knowledgeable persons. The purpose of this FGD with key informants is to go deep into the matters related to intervention and get opinions from the persons who are not the beneficiaries of this project either directly or indirectly. The key informants included in the FGD are- two local government representatives (member), one NGO officials, two school teachers, one journalist, two local leaders and one social worker. In addition, discussions were made with officials of land office, social welfare office etc at the Upazila level.

Table 2: Summary of Total Samples

Method	Quantity	Coverage	Types of Respondents
Structured Interview (Households)	104	26 villages (whole intervention area)	Household heads
FGD	10	8 FGD from 8 villages, 2 FGDs covering leaders of all village organizations	Members of Rokkhagola organization or leaders of Rokkhagola organization
FGD with KII	1	Intervention areas	UP representative 2, local leader 2, teacher 2, journalist 1, NGO official 1 and social worker 1.
SWOT Analysis	1	Intervention areas	▪ CCBVO's staff at local level

Besides the household survey and the FGDs, a SWOT analysis has been carried out. The case studies provide direct evidential proof of the positive impacts of the project. The SWOT analysis enabled the evaluation team to identify the potential and positive aspects of implementing the project while taking note of the weaknesses and risks associated with the project.

The whole evaluation is completed under the coordination of two teams- the core team and the field team for data collection. In addition, to quantitative data collectors, core team members also went to the field to collect data. Before inception to the data collection the data collectors were provided with proper instructions about the techniques to be applied in the field during data collection. Considering the sensitivity of the information required, special attention has been given to minimize the reluctance of the respondents to talk about their experience or behavior which may be embarrassing or socially disapproved. The fieldwork for data on questionnaire is conducted in 8 days.

TECHNIQUE OF DATA ANALYSIS

After collecting the data the evaluation team devoted themselves to management of data which involved data processing, data tabulation and data analysis. To this end the questionnaires are taken under registration and editing, open ended questions were listed and classified, data were entered, verified and edited, and tabulation was done using the software SPSS. At the next stage, analysis plan was developed as per the objectives of this evaluation study.

At the first stage, analysis of the quantitative data was performed which allows to portray the general socioeconomic and demographic features of the ethnic community people in the study area. In doing the quantitative analysis, data bank of CCBVO compiled from the weekly and monthly reports of the village organizers and supervisors, was also used. At the second stage, findings from the FGD and KII were synthesized. Each FGD and key informant's interview is written descriptively. Following the description, cross-case analysis is done. This means grouping of answers to common questions and we have taken the perspectives of the interviewees. Lastly review of previous information is done to

identify the process of implementation of the project, lapses between the pronounced goal and recoded achievements, and compare the official records and study data. All secondary data were analyzed independently.

DEMOGRAPHIC AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC FEATURES OF THE ETHNIC COMMUNITY IN THE PROJECT AREA

For the evaluation of the *Rokkhagola* project, the evaluation team has focused on the socio-economic condition of the ethnic communities in the project intervention area and tried to analyze quantitatively the issues such as food security, health, sanitation, treatment, education, culture, ownership of land and other assets, employment and occupation, social discrimination, discrimination against women, access to the government services etc. In analyzing the scenario on these issues the evaluation team has used two types of data- i) regular data collected by the monitoring wing of CCBVO from all the *Rokkhagola* organizations and ii) survey data of 104 respondent households collected by the survey team. CCBVO by its field supervisors collects aggregate data of all 26 villages on population, family size, age, education, occupation and ownership of land assets. Moreover, CCBVO has aggregate data for all *Rokkhagola* organizations on their total members, committee size, total food savings, food transactions and cash at bank. So, in analysis of these issues, aggregate data collected by the supervisors are used. Analysis of these issues is also supported by data collected from 104 respondents by the evaluation team. In the case of other issues, the evaluation team has completely dependent on the survey data.

In the project intervention area, there are 26 villages where *Rokkhagola* village based organizations are formed. In these villages, there are 1105 families living with an average family size of 4.9 persons. Thus, the total population coverage by the 26 organizations is 5665 of which 2860 are male population and 2805 are female population. Around 98.3% households are headed by male persons. These villages are inhabited by people of seven ethnic communities, namely, Santals, Oraon, Rajwar, Rai, Paharia, Sing and Hajra. CCBVO updates the information of total population and its sex distribution in every six months by the field organizers and supervisors. Based this aggregate data the ethnic distribution of the population in the project area who are covered in the *Rokkhagola* organization is provided in Table 3. From the table it is observed that there are 1198 Oraon people living in the project area who are registered under the *Rokkhagola* organization. These people comprise 21.19% of the total population covered by the project. Rajoar and Santal are the other two ethnic communities who comprise the next larger ethnic groups in the area. There are 17.66% Rajwar people and 14.13% Santal people living in the study area who enrolled in the *Rokkhagola* organizations. Other ethnic groups, as seen in the table, are Paharia, (7.97%), Rai (5.51%), Hajra (4.41%), Sing (3.53%), and Bangalee (4.49%) people in the project intervention area.

Table 3: Ethnic and Sex Distribution of the Population under Rokkhagola				
Name of Community	Sex Distribution of Population			% of total population
	Male	Female	T.Population	
Santal	464 57.99%	336 42.01%	801	14.13%
Oraon	861 59.17%	594 (40.83%)	1455	25.68%
Rajwar	600 60%	40 40%	1002	17.66%
Rai	175 56.09%	137 43.91%	311	5.51%
Paharia	247 54.89%	203 45.11%	452	7.97%
Sing	110 55.0%	90 45%	197	3.53%
Hajra(Dalit)	143 57.20%	107 42.8%	253	4.41%
Total	2860 (50.51)	2802 (49.49%)	5665	100%

Source: CCBVO documents

During the survey, information on the age of the household members were collected. CCBVO also collects information about age of every family member involved in Rokkhagola social organization. It also updates the age of the members every year. Using to that information age distribution of the population under the Rokkhagola organization is provided in the in Table 4 in the annex. In the table, it is observed that according to age the largest proportion of people fall in the age range 16 years to 30 years. 22.2% population fall in this age group. It is seen that family members of age up to 15 years and of age 60 years and above comprise a significant proportion of the total population. People of these two age groups are generally defined as dependent population. According to the data collected by the CCBVO office the rate of dependency in the project intervention area is 475 which means that in 1000 people in the study area 475 people are dependent. These people are dependent on the rest 520 people. It is also clear from the table that people of age 60 years and above is only 3.1% indicating the fact that ethnic people has lower expectancy of life compared to the average life expectancy of the people of Bangladesh.

Age structure of the population of the respondents' households is also analyzed to see whether the sample households have any difference in terms of age characteristics compared to the whole population under the Rokkhagola project. It is found that from in the 104 sample households there are 541 members with the family size 5.2. For the whole population it was 4.9. Dependency ratio is also found to be slightly different in the case of the sample households. While dependency ratio was 475 for the whole population it is 461 in the case of the sample households. This is shown in Table 4A in the annex.

It is always claimed that ethnic community people in Bangladesh are lagging behind due to lack of education. Therefore, the evaluation team has focused on the educational status of the members of the families who joined the Rokkhagola social organization. It is found from the investigation that education level among the ethnic community people is very low compared that in the mainstream population of Bangladesh. Along with other information CCBVO also collects data on education of the members of the *Rokkhagola* beneficiary families at regular interval. Educational status of the family members involved with *Rokkhagola* village based organization is provided in Table 5 in the annex. It is presented in the table that 34% of the ethnic population has no education, of which 22.7% can only sign their names and 11.3% cannot sign their names even. Among those who are educated have also very low level of education as 26.6% of whom have only primary school education followed by 23.4% people who are literate with education in between class six to nine. People with higher level of education such as HSC or graduation and above comprise of only 2.6% of the total population.

During the survey educational status of the household heads was also investigated. It is found that educational status of the sample household heads is very low. They are mostly found to be illiterate or have the ability to sign their names. 40.4% of the household heads under the survey can only sign their names. This scenario of education of the household heads is shown in Table 5A in the annex.

Table 6 (in the annex) provides information about literacy among the family members involved in the Rokkhagola village based organization. This analysis is based on the latest data collected by CCBVO staffs on all the family members (5665) under the 26 Rokkhagola organizations and presented in Table 6 in the annex. It is seen from the table that literacy rate (defined as the rate of education of people of age 6 years and above) in the ethnic community people in the project area is very low compared to the general scenario of Bangladesh. It is found from the information that the rate of literacy is 54.9% in the ethnic people who are lower than the literacy rate at national level (58%). However, the situation has been changed and these people are gradually becoming aware about the education of their children. This shows by the fact that 92.2% of the children of age 6 to 11 years are now enrolled in primary schools. As long as gross enrollment is concerned, it is seen that the rate is 79.75% in relation to the age group from 6 years to 24 years. However, it is found that drop out of children from school is also high in the ethnic populations, as the discontinuation rate is 13.5% found from the CCBVO data bank.

Drop out ethnic children from schools and colleges is a notable problem in the project area which is acting as an obstacle to increase the percentage of population with secondary, higher secondary or tertiary education. There are some reasons behind children's drop out from schools and colleges which

is analyzed from the opinions given by the sample respondents. CCBVO does not update data on children's drop out from educational institutions. Therefore, the evaluation team tried to find answers from the sample survey. The opinions of the respondents in this regard are provided in Table 7 in the annex. From the table it is found that 4.9% children cannot understand Bengali language at the initial stage of schooling for which they do not find interest to go to school, whether 19.3% children cannot fare well in school because they cannot absorb the lessons of the school given in the medium of Bengali, English and arithmetic. The most common reason came out in the opinions of the respondents is that parents cannot afford educational expenses which compels 55% children to stop going school. However, this situation has changed because of receiving financial assistance for education from Rokkhagola organization. As far as other reasons for dropout are concerned, it is found that in 4.5%, 1.9%, 5.8% and 60.4% cases children are dropped out from school because of discrimination against ethnic children, child marriage, child labour, and lack of awareness of parents, respectively.

During the survey the evaluation team tried to assess the quality of living of the ethnic people. As quality of living is difficult to measure quantitatively, researchers are often found to assess it with the help of income and expenditure patterns of the households. More income means more purchasing power and more consumption of goods and services. In the absence of data for all the households involved with the Rokkhagola organizations, the survey team again considered the income and expenditure levels of the respondent families.

It is found from Table 8 in the annex that ethnic community households earn less income and consequently incur less expenditure in maintaining their livelihoods. It is seen that the average monthly income of the sample ethnic households is only Tk. 4148.74 with maximum Tk. 8000.00 and minimum Tk. 20000.00 per month. It is also found that due to low level of income ethnic people are unable to grow savings as they have to spend almost the whole income for buying the daily 3986.22 with Tk.7750.00 as maximum expenditure and Tk. Tk. 2200.00 as the minimum expenditure.

During the survey it is found that people of the ethnic communities have different occupations as means to earn their livelihoods. Occupations of the heads of the sample households are shown in Table 9 in the annex. Most of the ethnic people in the project intervention area do not possess any land to cultivate while there are some marginal farmers who possess one, two or three *bighas* of land. The people who have no land, work in other's land as farm labour to earn income. From Table 9 it is observed that 55.8% respondents are involved as farm labour. 15.4% are marginal farmers while 16.4% households heads are involved with both farming at marginal scale and also serving as farm labor when complete their own farming works. Table 9 also revealed that 1% labour run their families by pulling rickshaw or van. In addition of these categories there are 9.6% people who involved in others occupation such as private and public job holders, doing petty business, working outside the village etc. It is also found from the survey that in ethnic families both husband and wife work for earning their livelihoods. In some families additional members are also found work for family earning. The average number of earning persons in the respondent families is 2.42.

In the project intervention area, people of the ethnic communities are mostly landless although some have limited land assets under their ownership. From the data collected by the CCBVO office it found that a significant portion of ethnic population in the study area has no cultivable land and even the land for homestead. Some have cultivable land but the amount is very small. The distribution of ethnic population by holding land asset in the project conducting area is given in Table 10 in the annex. From the table, it is clear that there is 67.3% sample respondents who have no cultivable land and 30.5% respondents have no homestead. On the other hand, there are only 20.7% population who have some land to cultivate. The sample households who have land of their own is also very small in quantity. From the field level study it is found that among these 32.7% respondents 14.5% have only 1 to 33 decimal land, 8.5% have 34 to 66 decimal land and 9.7% have above 66 decimal land. Table 10 also shows that 69.5% respondents have homestead land only and of them 13.2% have only 1 to 5 decimal land and 34.6%, 5.3%, 66.% and 9.7% have 6-10 decimal, 11-15 decimal, 16-20 decimal, and 20+ decimal land, respectively. 15% of the respondents of the ethnic communities benefit from *khas* land mostly for their homestead and 22.9% households do agriculture as share croppers.

The evaluation team has also investigated the land ownership pattern of the sample households taken under the survey. Land ownership pattern of the sample households resembles to that of the whole population as shown in Table 10A in the annex.

Although some ethnic families have own cultivable land and homestead land, the size of their land is very small. The average size of cultivable and other land owned by respondent families is shown in 10A. From the table it is observed that average land per family is only 13.16 decimal. The average size of homestead land is 7.11 decimal and average size of cultivable and other land is 14.72 decimal.

Besides land, there are some assets of ethnic households which are listed in Table 11 in the annex. Ethnic people in the project intervention area have only a few assets as they are very poor. Table 9 revealed that 92.5% ethnic households, who were interviewed during the sample survey, have bi-cycle which is used as transport for their personal movement and only 6.0% households have motorcycle for that purpose. Ethnic people have very few options for recreation. TV, radio and cassette players are seen be used for recreation means to them. From the table it is evident that 70.0% households have TV/Radio/Cassette players as recreational instrument. 1.2% ethnic households have rickshaw/van which they used to earn income in their daily life. Power tiller is used to plough land which is a valuable asset also. It is observed from the table that 12.5% households have power tiller. Mobile phone is important means for communicate with others. From Table 11 it is observed that 62.5% ethnic households have mobile phones.

Ethnic households rear hens, ducks, cows, goats, sheep etc. at home. A few also culture fish in ponds. They also plant tree at their house. During the survey investigation about the ethnic people's rearing of livestock and poultry was emphasized. It is found that ethnic people were mostly found to have cattle, hens, ducks, pigeons at their homes. Table 12 in the annex shows the account of rearing livestock and poultry by the respondent households. Among the 104 households, 62 (61%) households were found to have either hens or ducks or both at their homes. On the other hand, 83 household (80%) have cattle at their homes. Besides rearing poultry and cattle, some families rear goat/ sheep (64%) and some are found to involve in fish culture (16%). It is found that 62% families have planted trees at their home.

Ethnic households grow vegetables at their homestead and some have tress at their homesteads which are shown in Table 13 in the annex. From the table it is revealed that 86.2% families grow vegetables at their homestead and 49.8% have tress at their homestead.

To focus on the quality of lives of the ethnic population the evaluation team has looked in the nature of houses in the project area. It is seen that as most of the ethnic households are poor, they have mud wall and tin shade houses. The conditions of houses of them are analyzed in Table 14 in the annex. From the table it is shown that 92.3% houses are made of mud walls with tin shades. However, some people who cannot afford to buy tin, have houses with mud walls and grass roofs. Only 1.9% respondents have *pucca* wall and tin shade house and no households has *pucca* house.

Ethnic people face several problems in their daily life as a separate community. Most of them are discriminated in accessing to hotel, restaurant, saloon, tea stall. Sometimes others communities misbehave with ethnic people when they go to eat food to hotel and restaurant, when they go to take tea to tea stall and when they go to take services from saloon etc. However, recently this scenario has been changed because the outlook of Bengali and other communities towards ethnic communities have been changed overtime. 76.3% respondents in the project intervention area opined that other community people misbehaved with them in hotel, restaurant, saloon, tea stall etc. 37.4% respondent reported that they are not allowed to take meal in Bengali houses. Ethnic people also face physical and mental torture and sometimes they are threatened of eviction from home stead. From Table 15 in the annex it is observed that 47.5%, 47.5% and 23.8% respondent opined that ethnic people face the problems of physical torture, mental torture, and threat of eviction from homestead. Ethnic women is also not saved from other communities. 46.3% respondent reported that ethnic women sometime tortured by the people of other communities.

ANALYSIS OF ROKKHAGOLA ORGANIZATION

This section of the report depicts the features and characteristics of the *Rokkhagola* social organization, the activities under it and the outputs of the activities. To these end, data from the sample survey as well as monitoring data on the *Rokkhagola* organizations of 26 villages kept in the CCBVO office are used.

At the first step, it is necessary to know the size of the *Rokkhagola* organizations in terms of number of families involved in the *Rokkhagola* organizations in the 26 villages. Since the sample includes respondents from all the villages, it helped the evaluation team to get from the respondents the number of families joined in the organization and the families who remained outside the organization. However, these data are available in the CCBVO monitoring documents as well. Using the information from the respondents and having it cross checked with the CCBVO documents, a description of the involvement of the ethnic families with *Rokkhagola* social organization is provided in Table 16. It is found that on the average, each *Rokkhagola* organization has 42.5 member families with highest 62 families in the village Pathorghata and Belganga, and the lowest 19 families in the village Nimghutu. It is also found that on the average 7.7 families are remaining outside the *Rokkhagola* organization.

Table16: Households Involvement with Rokkhagola Social Organization					
Name of Village	Number of families joined	Number of families not joined	Name of Village	Number of families joined	Number of families not joined
Choitonnapur	60	9	Baganpara	55	2
Nimkuri	25	4	Gonakardawin	30	0
Shahanapara	43	2	Farshapara	44	3
Pathorghata	62	8	Kamlapur Bilpara	45	16
Katapasha-Idolpur	48	4	Edalpur	36	15
Beldanga	62	7	Murariapur	38	12
Golai	38	3	Gogram	47	13
Jiolmary	21	9	Gunigram	45	17
Gordaing	56	4	Udipur	49	17
Mulkidangi	30	0	Agalpur	41	14
Daingpara	51	6	Dadoir	47	10
Nimghutu	19	2	Sakura	35	7
Shreerampur-Biroil	36	6	Norshingor Adorshogam	42	10

Source: CCBVO documents

CCBVO has started its core program with the name “Rokkhagola village based sustainable food security program for ethnic community” from the beginning of 2001 in some villages in Godagari Upazila of Rajshahi District. Some households joined at the beginning of the organization and some joined successively with time. The distribution of all the member households (1105) with respect to length of membership in Rokkhagola organization is provided in Table 17 in the annex. From the table it is observed that 3.3% families have joined the organization in last one year, 13.3% completed two years of their residing with the organization and 28.6% for three years. The highest proportions of member families (41.9%) belong to four years group. It is observed that there are 5.8% member families who joined the Rokkhagola organization six or more years ago.

Rokkhagola social organization is the core of the *Rokkhagola* village based sustainable food security project. In 26 ethnic villages all most all the ethnic families are the members of the village organization. The organizations have specific manuals for functioning. There is a general body of the organizations consisting of all the member households. To run the function main responsibility is given to its executive committee who take all the decisions about the organization. Under the executive committee

there are some subcommittees such as health subcommittee, education sub-committee etc. These features of the *Rokkhagola* organization are presented in Table 18. From the table it is found that the average number of families per *Rokkhagola* is 42.5. Average number of general members (persons) and executive members per *Rokkhagola* are 218 and 9. Executive committee consists of both male and female members. Average male member and female member in executive committee per *Rokkhagola* are 5 and 4. All *Rokkhagola* social organizations has health, education, security and cultural committees. Each *Rokkhagola* arrange two meeting per month. In general meetings per month at least 75% members attend. Again, in the meeting of executive committee 80% members attend regularly. *Rokkhagola* house is the symbol of the organization. It is found that all of the 26 organizations have their own *Rokkhagola* house, the house is completely built in 23 villages while in 3 villages the work will be completed by December 2014.

Table18 : Features of <i>Rokkhagola</i> Organization	
Features	Number and percentage
Average number of families	42.5
Average size of general members	218
Average size of executive committee	9
Average number of male members in executive committee	5
Average number of female member in executive committee	4
% of <i>Rokkhagola</i> organization having health committee	100
% of <i>Rokkhagola</i> organization having security committee	100
% of <i>Rokkhagola</i> organization having education committee	100
% of <i>Rokkhagola</i> organization having cultural committee	100
% of General members attend in the monthly meeting	75
% of executive committee members attend in the monthly meeting	80
Number of <i>Rokkhagola</i> organization completed their house	26 (23 already completed and rest 3 will be completed by December 2014)

Source: CCBVO documents and sample survey

The *Rokkhagola* organization has a system holding meetings of the general body and executive committees at specific time interval. The sub committees also have the provision to hold meetings at specific intervals. To investigate whether these meetings hold routinely, the respondents were asked meeting of these bodies or committees hold as per the stipulated times. This is shown in Table 19 in the annex. It is found that according to 92% respondents' opinion general meeting holds regularly while according to only 8% respondents general meeting does not hold regularly. 100% reported that meeting of executive holds regularly. Besides general and executive meeting health committee meetings, education committee, security committee and cultural committees also hold meetings which are provided in the table below.

It is reported by the respondents that in the meeting of the general body and the executive committee different issues come under discussion. The issues can be raised by any person or member of the general or executive committee. It is learnt that weekly food saving is the main issue of discussion in every meeting. Related with this food transaction or food assistance and savings in the banks are also important issues that are discussed in every meetings. However, there are many other issues related to the live and society of the ethnic people, which are also discussed at least occasionally. The issues are investment of bank deposit, village disputes, security of villagers, education of children, marriage and funeral of family members, child marriage etc. This is provided in Table 20 in the annex.

Through the *Rokkhagola* organization the villagers save food, paddy and sometimes money for their food security and other purposes. Generally, each family save rice in weekly basis at a rate of 0.5 Kg or 1 Kg Besides rice the save paddy at a rate of 5 Kg per season. One of the major problems of ethnic households is that they do not have sanitary latrine. Therefore, the members of some *Rokkhagola*

deposits Tk. 5.00 per week to be able to build latrine. This information is provided in Table 21 in the annex. From the table it is observed that 98.5% families deposit 0.5 Kg. of rice per week and only 3.5% families deposit 1 Kg. of rice per week. From the table it is found that 8.5% respondent deposits money for making latrine

Ethnic people have been depositing rice and paddy in the *Rokkhagola* house in weekly and season basis, respectively, to achieve food security. After certain time they sell saved rice and paddy and deposit money in banks because rice and paddy may be damaged if they are remained in the *Rokkhagola* house for long time. They deposit the money in banks that they receive from selling rice and paddy. These information are preserved in the CCBVO documents. Deposit situation of *Rokkhagola* is reported in Table 23 in the annex. From the table it is revealed that total deposit of rice in 26 *Rokkhagola*, as per the records stood at 96,456.5 Kgs. in 2013 and it increased to 125,389.5 Kgs. in 2014. On the other hand the total amount of paddy in 26 *Rokkhagola* was 16,520 Kgs. in 2013 and it increased to 20,626 Kgs. in 2014. On the other hand total amount of money deposits in bank is Tk. 768115.00 and total amount of cash in hand is Tk. 172693.

Most of the members of *Rokkhagola* save rice and paddy regularly. Regularity of savings practice of the members of *Rokkhagola* social organization is shown in Table 24 in the annex. From the table it is found that 86% families saved rice in *Rokkhagola* regularly, 8% families sometimes cannot save rice every week and but they save it in next week. There are another 4% families which cannot deposit rice in one or two weeks but save within one month and only 2% family's deposit rice after one month. From the table it is also found that 100% families deposit paddy in due time.

One of the main objectives of saving of rice, paddy and money in the *Rokkhagola* organization is to enable its members to get assistance from those stock of rice and paddy, and stock of money during their needs in the lean seasons. It is found from the field survey that members of *Rokkhagola* organizations widely taken rice assistance from *Rokkhagola* during food crisis and also at the time of family occasions such as marriage or funeral rite. Members also took money assistance from the organization to meet up the education expenses and treatment expenditures during ailments. Assistance taken by respondents from *Rokkhagola* organization is presented in Table 25. From the table it is found that 95.7% respondent have taken rice, 9.9% respondent have taken money and only 0.7% respondent have taken paddy as assistance,

Accor to reports of the respondents, among the families took rice assistance from the *Rokkhagola* organization, highest 51.1% taken 21 Kg to 40 Kg of rice as assistance. 24.0% families taken 40 Kg or more rice which 20.6 % families taken in between 11Kg to 20Kg of rice as assistance. In the case taking money assistance from the *Rokkhagola*, it is learnt that most families borrowed a amount of money less than 10,000 taka.

Generally, a person takes meals three times per day. As food shortage was a chronic problem to the ethnic people, many of them were found to take less than three times meals per day as they could not manage that amount of food. Therefore, questions were asked as to how many time a day food is taken by the ethnic people. In response, it is found from the survey that 83% of the ethnic people in the study villages take meals three times a day. 17.2% people told that they take two meals per day, not because of food shortage but due to their long time stay at the field. No respondents reported about taking one meal per day. The respondents reported that due food assistance or borrowing system people can manage to get three times meal per day even in the crisis times. This is shown in Table 26 in the annex.

ANALYSIS OF ETHNIC PEOPLES ACCESS TO GOVERNMENT SERVICES

Although Bangladesh is a poor country, the government has been providing many supports for the betterment of the poor people living in the rural area. There are several government agencies and departments of the government which are providing services to the poor and vulnerable people in the rural areas. However, due to inability and lack of awareness ethnic people seldom avail these supports provided by the people to cater to the rural area of the country. In this section this is analyzed using the survey data. Therefore, one of the objectives of CCBVO's *Rokkhagola* project is to increase the ethnic people's access to these government services.

Ethnic people suffer from different types of diseases which are shown in Table 27 in the annex. From the table it seen that 93% families of the ethnic communities suffered from at least disease in last one year. It is also shown that 88.1% families suffered from cold/fever, 33.1% suffered from skin disease,

67.8% suffered from dysentery, 71.2% suffered from diarrhea, 45.5% suffered from jaundice, 60.8% suffered from gastric and 9.9% families suffered from other diseases.

When suffered from diseases, ethnic people received treatment from different sources such as medical hospital, Upazila health complex, private hospital or clinic, drug shops, village doctor, homeopathy doctor etc. The sources of treatment of the ethnic people are shown in Table 28. From the table it is found that 34.3% respondents reported that they receive treatment from Rajshahi medical hospital while 17.6% respondents reported that they take treatment from upazila health complex. Besides government hospital and health complex they also go to private hospital, private clinic and NGO clinic to take treatment (10.7%).

In response to whether the members face any problem in case of getting treatment from the government hospitals or Upazila health centres, it is found that lot of ethnic people sometimes face the problem of discrimination in the hospitals and health centres by the doctors or the staffs. Another problem with the government hospitals and health centres is that government hospitals do not have many essential medicines at the hospital store.

Union Parishad is the door step agency from which services can be availed easily. During the survey, 94% respondents reported that they went to the Union Parishad in last one year for taking service. The purpose for which ethnic people went to the Union Parishad are- birth registration, issue of national ID card, certificate for cattle, disputes with others, etc. According their opinion, chairman and members of the union parishad pays good attention on the needs although in some cases they misbehave with the people of the ethnic communities.

During the survey, people were asked about their connection with the upazila level offices. Only a few respondents reported that they went to the upazila level offices in last two years. Most of them go to the land office, fishery office etc.

ANALYSIS OF ETHNIC PEOPLES' CULTURE AND HERITAGE

Ethnic people in the project intervention area have their own language, culture and religion. They have distinguishing traditions embedded in their livelihood practices. However, due to the influence of many factors the culture and other traditions of these ethnic people are getting diminished day by day. Therefore, of the objective of the Rokkhagola project is to conserve the culture and traditions of the ethnic people.

During the survey, investigation was done to identify the kinds of social and religious cultural functions are observed by the ethnic people. It is found that Monsa puja, Durga puja, Laksmi puja, Kali puja, Swarosati puja, Jonmastomy etc. are the religious occasions observed by the ethnic people who follow traditional religion. There are some ethnic people who follow Christianity and they observe Christmas and Ester Sunday. There are some social events such as Baha, Fagua, Karam, Nabanna etc. which are observed by all. Ethnic people in the project area are found to observe various days such as the Adibashy day, Birsha Munda day, Sidhu-Kanu day etc.

In observing the above religious and social festivals the ethnic people generally organize cultural functions consisting of songs, dances, foods etc. They also organize cultural competitions in the village. During the time of marriage ceremony of their children and at the time of death funerals they do some rituals collectively. From the beginning of the Rokkhagola organization, conservation of ethnic people's culture and heritage is emphasized by CCBNO. The scenario of conserving culture and heritage by the ethnic communities is provided in Table

Table 30: Features of Culture and Heritage by Ethnic Communities	
% of families have own musical instruments at their homes	57
% of village organize cultural functions	100
% of villages organize cultural competition	70
% of people participate in cultural function and competition	90
% of households contribute to bear the cost of cultural function	80
Funeral Rituals observed if someone dies (%)	100
% of members participate in annual Rokkhagola gathering	100
Total Respondent	104

Source: Sample survey and CCBVO documents

During the survey, focus was given to look into the level of awareness of the ethnic people about conserving their culture and tradition. It is found that ethnic people are gradually getting aware about own culture and heritage. Table 31 in the annex revealed that 85% ethnic people understand that many of the traditional culture are in extinction now. 72% opined that there are many food items used to be eaten by their early generations which are not being eaten now. However, the ethnic people are of the opinion that after the functioning of the Rokkhagola organization many of the traditional cultural activities are getting revived and people are becoming more aware about their own culture and heritage.

OTHER ISSUES OF DEVELOPMENT OF THE ETHNIC COMMUNITIES

Rokkhagola project was supposed to contribute to the development of the ethnic people are the areas of health, sanitation, child marriage, child laboring etc. Therefore during the survey, these issues were also investigated by the evaluation team.

Water scarcity is a common phenomenon among ethnic households in the study area. Ethnic households have no tube well under their personal ownership to collect water. They use common tube well set up by the government or non-government organization. From Table 32 it is seen that there are tube wells in the village for per 15.54 families in 2013 and per 14.98 families in 2014.

Sanitary latrine is one of the most important components of healthy environment. However, due to poverty most of the families do not own any latrine at their homes and they have to practice open defecation. However, the situation is changing now and the awareness about setting latrine is increasing among the ethnic people.

Ethnic people are very poor and most of them do not have education or higher education. They are not well conscious about negative sides of child marriage and child labour. During the study they were asked about child marriage and child labor occurring in the villages. 28% respondents reported that there child marriage is still prevalent in their villages while 14% respondent reported that there is child labour in their in the village.

The evaluation team has emphasized on investigating women's participation in family decision making, as it an indicator of women empowerment at family level. It is already mentioned that ethnic communities basically practice patriarchal norms where women are mostly kept outside during the important decision making of the family. However, due to the influence of Rokkhagola organization now the situation is changing and women are taking part in family decision making although their participation is still not high at the family level.

Women's participation status at different level of family decisions is presented in Table 33. It is seen that although women were found to have participation power in the Rokkhagola organization, their participation in their own family in different decision making is very low. It is seen the women's participation in making decision on issues such as purchasing assets, selling crops/cattle/poultry, choice of crops in land, building and repairing house etc is very low.

Indicator Table

Goal/Results	Indicator	Planned Target	Annual Report 2013	Phase Evaluation
Goal: Ethnic communities in 26 villages are systematically and successfully working for sustainable village development	% of man and women are members of functional R village organization under own management	90%	--	80%
	% of members minimized starvation during lean period	100%		100%
	% of villagers aware of and demand for their rights and government services	50%		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 35% (aware of their rights and services from UP) - 5% (aware of their rights and services from upazila level offices)
	Villagers practice own socio-cultural festivals and traditions	100%	72%	80%

Goal/Results	Indicator	Planned Target	Annual Report 2013	Phase Evaluation
Result 1: Ethnic communities are united in the village based Rokkhagola organization	Enrollment in R organization	100%	86%	90%
	Functioning of R organization smoothly and take collective decision smoothly	100%	75%	90%
	Women in management committee	50%	49%	48%
	Members participating in the meeting	60%	- 65% general members - 70% committee members	- 70% general members - 80% committee members - 95% in annual gathering
Result 2: Rokkhagola food banks at village level are functioning and food security is ensured	Regularity of food savings	90%	80%	90%
	Mutual food transaction ensured	100%	82%	85%
	Families have homestead gardening	30%	- 20% involve in homestead gardening	- 50% (homestead garden)
	Rearing poultry and cattle	--	- 20% involve in poultry and duck rearing	- 60% (rear poultry and duck) - 80% involve with livestock
Result 3: Ethnic communities have enhanced access to government services, social security and their rights	Services avail from health centre	50%	15%	39%
	Services avail from union Parishad	50%	18.3%	32%
	Services avail from upazila level offices	--	--	4%
	Increase of enrollment of children in government primary school	50%	15%	25%
Result 4: Ethnic communities protect their own cultural heritage	People observed social festival	90%	72%	85%
	People participate in religious festivals	90%	--	95%
	People aware about preserve own culture and heritage	100%	50%	75%

ANALYSIS OF FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION AND KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

In order to get in-depth insights about the functioning of the *Rokkhagola* organization and the livelihood effects on the ethnic community people, their activities towards the targets of the project, focus group discussions and key informant interviews are also carried out, in addition to the household survey. 11 focus group discussions were carried out with general members and committee members of the *Rokkhagola* organization, and 09 key informants interviewed are also done with local elites, other NGO representatives, teachers, local elected representatives etc. All group interviews are taken in selected place in the project intervention area.

ISSUES ADDRESSED IN THE FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION

Well structured guidelines were followed in conducting group interviews for the groups of members and committee members of the *Rokkhagola* organization. The broader issues focused during the interviews were the process of group formation, motivation behind the membership and activities of the groups. Socio-economic background of the members was also discussed in details. Opinions of the members regarding the activities were also highlighted properly. One of the principal focus of the project was to ensure food security, a perennial problem the ethnic community people have facing since

long time. During the lean period food security becomes a very serious problem for the ethnic people. Therefore, this issue was highlighted with proper emphasis. Networking among different Rokkhagola groups was also discussed thoroughly. Particular problems of the ethnic community amidst mainstream Bengali races, their land related problems, the problem of access to government and social services etc. were discussed with great care. Furthermore, some cross cutting issues such as gender, land rights, education, health, sanitation aspects were also covered during the focus group discussion.

Each and every individual activity performed by the focus group members were addressed separately during the interview. The activities were ranked according to the desire and performance of the group members. Recommendations for further improvement of the activities and limitations were discussed. Information obtained from one group was also cross-checked into the interview of other groups to validate the collected data.

OUTCOMES THE FGDS

- a. **Group formation, motivation and activities:** During the focus group discussion information about group formation process and activities of the group were discussed with the participants. It is found that majority of the Rokkhagola social organizations were formed from persuasion by the CCBVO's field organisers at the initial stage. However, in the later stage some groups were formed spontaneously in other villages as they observed the positive effects of Rokkhagola village based organization already at work in the neighboring villages. There are several factors which worked to motivate the ethnic villagers to form the Rokkhagola social organization as well as join in the groups. **Firstly**, as people of the indigenous communities have been facing food shortage problem, the system of food saving and taking assistance from the Rokkhagola proved to be a reliable resort for them to get rid of hunger during the days of food shortage. **Secondly**, before the activation of the Rokkhagola system, people had to borrow from local money lenders at high interest rate which led them fall into further indebtedness. To their understanding, Rakkhagola system rescued them from that vicious trap. **Thirdly**, ethnic community people are mostly poor who generally spend all their time for earning their food and they had no opportunity to think of and learn about the necessary aspects of life and about their society and culture. The Rakkhagola meetings are found to them to be a good platform where many things can be discussed and many things can be learnt. **Finally**, people of ethnic communities are mostly conservative and are bonded to their own governing, cultural and religious systems. As the *modus operandi* of CCBVO targets the development of these communities through harmonization with the system, culture and traditions of the indigenous people, involvement of the head of the community (*Morol*) as the chief of the Rakkhagola organization gave the villagers additional motivation to join the Rakkhagola organizations. However, the participants were reporting that intra-community feuds and negative propaganda by the vested interest groups sometimes deter people to join and keep with the organization.
- b. **Operation System of Rokkhagola organization:** During the FGDs various aspects of the operation of Rokkhagola organization were discussed with the participants. To the opinion of the participants, the system of functioning of the groups is innovative and encouraging for the members and leaders of the organization. Unlike the groups belong to other NGOs worked before in these villages, Rokkhagola organization authorized the villagers themselves to take their own decision about how to run the organization, how to collect the savings, how to use these savings for ensuring food security of the people. These has driven out the existence of any confusion about the objective of CCBVO from the mind of the people and increased their sense of responsibility of running the organization efficiently and using the resources in appropriate ways. Before the formation of the Rokkhagola organization, ethnic peoples did not know the formal system of running and conducting meetings, taking notes and keeping records of the decisions passed in the meetings, and dealing with bank accounts. CCBVO has contributed here by providing them with a printed operation manual for each Rokkhagola organization and by giving them special training on the duties and responsibilities of the general and executive committees and on the system of running organizational and banking functions. This has resulted in increased capacity building in the people of the ethnic community.

- c. **Coverage of Activities by Rokkhagola organization:** During the FGDs, participants were asked to give their opinion about the functions performed under the Rokkhagola organization. It is found from the discussion that collection of food saving (rice and paddy) and disbursement of food as assistance to those who suffer food shortage is the main activity of the Rokkhagola organization. As almost all the families living in the village enrolled to the Rokkhagola organization, and all members of a family are the members of this organization, it turned to be the platform of solving all matters related to the life of the ethnic population. Thus, whatever problems happen in the village such as feuds between two families, or problems created by outsiders the quarrelling sides first come to the Rokkhagola committee and the committee solves it in a democratic way. In the case of any family events such as marriage ceremony or funeral ceremonies the organization extends its hand in terms of providing assistance as per Rokkhagola rule and also in terms of helping the family in person. The organization takes lead in arranging social and religious occasions and festivals as well. Finally, the organization has provision for several sub committees such as education sub-committee, health sub-committee, security sub-committee, cultural sub-committee etc. to take care of the problems related to education and health, ensure security of the lives and resources of the community and facilitate ethnic traditions and culture to a wider extent.
- d. **Integrity of the ethnic people:** During the discussion issues were raised as to whether Rokkhagola has contributed to promote their unity and cooperation, which is the basic tradition of the ethnic tribes. It came out from the discussion that after the establishment of the Rokkhagola the unity and integrity of the ethnic people has significantly increased. As they meet regularly in the monthly meetings, act together during saving of food grain and taking food support from the reserve interaction among them has increased which lead to increase their unity and integrity. Moreover, they organize an annual gathering where members of all Rokkhagola come with their family. This leads to increase their community feeling and contributed to increase their integrity and coherence. They reported that previous to the Rokkhagola organization they did not feel sit and work together although they live in the same village.
- e. **Rokkhagola Organization and Changes in Ethnic lives:** Participants in the FGDs reported of many visible impacts of their activities under the Rokkhagola organization. The most visible impact of this project is the achievement of food security of the ethnic people. Food crisis has been a perennial problem of the ethnic people since ages. They faced severe food crisis in the lean seasons when they found no work. Under this situation, they used to borrow paddy or money from the local money lenders with a very high rate of interest to meet food, treatment or other expenses. Normally they back their loan by selling their seasonal crops, which push them to extreme consequence on their lives and existence. With the provision of food saving and food transaction under Rokkhagola organization this food security problem along with the risk of getting exploited by local money lenders has been put to an end. Other NGOs which had been working in the past has closed their activities as people do not want to be with them anymore.

According the FGD participants, and also to the opinion of the survey respondents, ethnic people are motivated enough to grow vegetables in their homestead as part of meeting food and nutrition needs as well as rearing livestock and poultry to earn additional income for their families.

According to the FGD participants, Rokkhagola project has resulted in increased access of the ethnic people to avail provisions of government services through different government offices or agencies. This is made possible by increasing awareness of the ethnic people through discussions during general and executive committee meetings of the organization. Moreover, networking and obtaining information about such government services has also been encouraged. Thus, now it is found that ethnic people are going to the UP to get their needs fulfilled and problems solved. And in the local clinics, ethnic people found no hesitation to seek medical services at the time of their sickness. Increase in awareness has also increased about the necessity of educating the children. It is found that after formation of the Rokkhagola organizations school enrollment of the children has increased considerably.

One of the impacts of the activities of Rokkhagola organization is build up of confidence and sense of security in the ethnic people. The Rokkhagola houses, which are constructed, with CCBVO's

financial help, for storing food grain and facilitating place for meeting has become a symbol of their security. The accumulated savings for each individual family and the whole community has boosted up their confidence that they can now do many things for their well being which they could not think in the past.

It is found that as a result of the families' involvement with the groups, awareness of the families about safe water, sanitation, immunization has been increased considerably. Participants' knowledge about transmission of some deadly communicable diseases such as AIDS or STD has also increased.

- f. **Indigenous culture and heritage:** The activities of the Rokkhagola organization have given the ethnic people impetus to use their own language and practice their culture more and more, conserve their traditions and heritage for their very identification and existence. They now realize that culture, customs and traditions are the roots of their community identification and as a result they are getting more participatory in the observance of different indigenous festivals and rituals. The families in the project area are now found to have different musical instruments which indicate their motivation toward conserving own culture and heritage.
- g. **Other development Issues:** Activities of Rokkhagola organization and discussions during the meetings have resulted in many positive impacts to fall on the lives of the indigenous people. As far as human development issues are concerned, it is found that ethnic peoples in the project intervention area have achieved successes in the fronts of women empowerment, education, health, water, leadership, child marriage, child labor etc. Women, trained in the Rokkhagola meetings, are now become vocal about their opinions and rights. As they are united they have successfully tell their water scarcity problem to the UP and in many villages they have managed to get tube-wells from the UP. It is found from the opinions of the FGD participants that after the functioning of the Rokkhagola organization child marriage and child labor have decreased considerably. However, it is found that women are still lagging behind men as the social setting is basically male dominated and further steps need to be taken to promote empowerment of the women.
- h. **Problems with indigenous communities:** Questions were asked regarding the problems facing the ethnic peoples in the project area. Participants in the FGD reported that indigenous people are facing some special problems. The main problem of these people their land related problem. It is learnt that indigenous peoples frequently get exploited and cheated by land grabbers and there are reports that some land are already grabbed by the local powerful Bengali people, which (land) according to their knowledge belong their parents. There are several khas ponds and water bodies in the project area which are adjacent to the living place of the ethnic people. However, these ponds and water bodies are occupies by the outsiders who do not allow the ethnic people even using the water by the family members. Another land related problem is the grabbing of the grave yard by the owners of adjacent lands. As the grave yards gradually reduce in this way or some have already disappeared, ethnic people have to suffer a lot when someone of their family members dies. Lastly, ethnic people still are facing social discrimination in their everyday dealing at government offices, schools, markets etc. with derogative remarks made by the Bengali people and showing negligence to meet the needs of the indigenous people.
- i. **Recommendations of the Participants:** All the participants of the FGDs express positive views on the activities of the Rokkhagola project. To their opinion, Rokkhagola project has already made visible proofs of success in reducing the food crisis of the indigenous population. However, they put forward some suggestions to strengthen bring about wider impacts on the society. To their opinion, CCBVO should take serious care of the issue of khas land. If these land can be settled in favor of the ownership of the ethnic people then food security of the people will be enhances further. They urged CCBVO to make some bridging arrangements by networking with other organization so that the ethnic people can enjoy their due share of government services. Although food security has been ensured, lacking still prevails in terms of taking quality food with proper nutrition. CCBVO should concentrate on this.
- j. **Problems with Rokkhagola Activities:** The participants have pointed out some the problems and limitations that are barring people to obtain further benefits. In some of the ethnic villages conflicts among the families and clans still remain. Due to this problem some families in the villages were found to be reluctant to join Rokkhagola organization although they recognize its positive sides.

Although CCBVO promote self functioning of the organizations, they still needs help from the CCBVO staffs as there is still lack of people with leadership ability in the villages. In this respect the CCBVO staffs working for them are very few in number.

It is observed that networking with local government bodies at the union level and public officials at the thana and district level is poor. The reason identified as crucial that at the union level, the elected leaders, for example union Parishad chairman and members are not very cooperative when some of the activities go against their interest. Moreover, ethnic people by nature are more hesitant to go to these offices from the fear of getting maltreatment as they experienced previously.

The FGDs supported the study finding that most of the targeted families lack adequate resource for improvement of their livelihoods. The members of the organization have achieves some motivation by this time. Trainings, awareness sessions etc. towards income generating activities would prove to be very effective for further upliftment of their livelihood.

- k. **Overall Positive Impacts of the Project as came out in the FGDs:** From the FGD analyses it is found that this program has significantly contributed to the awareness building of ethnic people. The group members are now well aware about their problems and they are extremely vocal about their demands. Their participation in the interview was spontaneous and has shown marked difference between them and usual ethnic people living outside the project area in terms of openness and fluency in telling their demands and social problems. All of the respondents admitted that the intervention of *Rokkhagola* project has mostly contributed to their progress. A chain of information network has been developed through interaction of different Rokkhagola groups. They are now more confident in sharing and dealing with their social as well as family problems. Thus, it is come out from the FGDs that the project has less or more achieved its objective of capacity building in the ethnic peoples and thereby the overall goal of food security and poverty alleviation. Consensus was also found in the FGDs that empowering of the women have been increased remarkably as a result of interventions under *Rokkhagola* project.

OUTCOMES FROM KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

While talking to the group of key informants, specific guidelines were followed again. As key informants are generally not fully aware about the details of the project, their opinions were asked on such aspects as livelihood strategies, potentials and vulnerabilities of the indigenous people, and about the Rokkhagola organization. Changing patterns of the rural peoples' lives, attitudes and behaviors are also discussed with them. As locally involved in many activities, these key informants can identify the problems of the area as well as problems of the peoples including the ethnic communities. Availability of local resources and development potentials using these resources are also the issues of discussion with the key informants. The following are the outcome of the discussion with the key informants.

As per the opinions of the key informants, previous to this project, poverty was widespread in the people of the intervention areas and there was considerable level of vulnerability existing in the area. These vulnerabilities mainly stemmed from poverty, lack of awareness, illiteracy etc. and the vulnerabilities include possibility of being starved, being exploited and tortured, and resources grabbed by others. They opined that the Rokkhagola saving system has brought about a revolutionary change in the condition of food security of the ethnic people. It is found from the discussion with the key informants that the indigenous people are very laborious and are motivated towards developing themselves. However, due to resource lacking they cannot go ahead. If NGOs or government agencies include them somehow in their working framework then the community will gain.

Regarding local assets that can be useful for employment generation and opportunity of work for the ethnic people, the key informants are of the opinion that bringing back the khas lands to the benefit of the indigenous people is necessary. Generation of human asset through increasing education in them is also crucial for their further development. There are many opportunities in the local areas and these opportunities can be harvested by the ethnic people if their capability can be developed and good

environment exists. They opined that indigenous people produces several commodities which they cannot market properly. If any system can be invented so that they can market their products without being cheated, their traditional off-farm activities will be increased which would bring a meaningful change in their lives.

It is found from the key informant interviews that the ethnic people can be given training on local resource based income generating activities. In project area there is scope for the ethnic people to culture fish, poultry, some non-farm activities. Regarding training, the key informants were of the opinion that trainings should be need based which will increase capability of the ethnic people as well as generate new economic activities. A high official in the Upazila land office reported that there is still a significant amount of land in the hand of the government which can be allocated among the poor indigenous families.

On the whole the key informant group is very much optimistic about the positive impacts of the Rokkhagola village based organization.

STRENGTH, WEAKNESS, OPPORTUNITIES AND THREATS ANALYSIS

The Study team conducted a SWOT analysis with the field level staffs of CCBVO. It is found from the opinion of the participants that the acceptance of the program by the ethnic people, their families and the community are the main strength of the project, Rokkhagola. People have accepted the development concept of CCBVO quickly. The indigenous people have taken the program positively and consider the activities very much beneficial for them as well as for their community. This gives CCBVO an opportunity to undertake more programs tagging with this program. The project has three main weaknesses. Firstly, the implementation plan of the project looked very slow which hindered the execution of the project activities properly. Moreover, the monitoring and study system of the project also looked very poor. Because of lack of proper monitoring, performance activities also differed across villages. This needs to be taken care of. Secondly, some activities of the project have been taken without much farsightedness. For example, the project authorizes the groups to take decisions of their own. However, if the groups cannot take proper decision by themselves, there is no clear cut guidance in this regard. Thirdly, the staffs of the project have less training. It is found from the study that all the Rokkhagola village organizations have already managed to develop a healthy amount of deposit. So, there is an opportunity for them to invest this saving for generating further income for the benefit of all the group members. There is no major threat on the program. However, religious fundamentalism and vested interest groups might stand against the project activities.

ANALYSIS OF THE IMPACTS OF THE PROJECT

Based on the household survey, the FGDs, and the SWOT analysis, the evaluation team has identified several impacts stemmed from the Rokkhagola project on different aspect of the lives and livelihood of the indigenous people in the study area. These are discussed below from socio-economics, leadership and cultural aspects of the ethnic people:

IMPACTS ON SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITION

1. The Rokkhagola system has promoted self reliance in the ethnic population in taking their decisions about solution of problems and getting development. The infrastructure, Rokkhagola house, for storing food grains is the visible outcome of the project. The impact of the existence of this infrastructure has various dimensions. The house provided space for preservation or storing food grains as well as space for community integration. The grain house is a visible symbol of food security- impact on self esteem. The amount of preserved food grain is varying from one Rokkhagola to another. However, the perception that food is not unavailable is evidently indicating the impact of community confidence about their sense of security. The psychological impact is significant on the community that they enough to eat for the whole year and provides basis for addressing other needs of community welfare. The pride and sense of security due to cash and food grain reserve is one of the crucial impacts for the community, especially who are facing cultural aggression besides of economic exploitation.

2. One of the considerable impacts of this project is to overcome the food crisis in lean season. The establishment of Rokkhagola has direct impact on the capacity to face the challenges of lean season crisis. In this connection, freedom from dependency ties from money lenders is one of the impacts that should be considered from economic, social and political perspectives. The economic benefit is obvious as it mention above- in terms of not paying higher interest and able to retain live supporting assets such as land. As economic dependency means not only exploitation of material resources but also deprivation of social dignity and political voices, the resource accumulation under the Rokkhagola system is functioning as means to promote social dignity and power control. Moreover, the project has resulted in reduced dependency on microcredit service organizations less presence of the credit based NGOs in their area.
3. Through saving of food grains, collective fund is created besides of food grain store. The collective fund, deposited in the bank, has impact on other collective initiatives like collective cultivation of land and collective leasing of land for community benefits. The value of collectiveness is reestablished and this has increased the community cohesiveness. The impact of collective action is increased economic benefits, nevertheless, it is also created the basis of social harmony and peace.
4. Initiation of social business by the community organization is one of the direct impacts of the savings program besides the preservation of food grains. As the members have savings sizable enough to be invested the community leaders decided to invest it in a manner that is within their capacity, experience based and without risks. For instance, buying paddy in harvesting time preserving it for reselling in the lean season, or taking land under lease contract and cultivate collectively to raise Rokkhagola's earning etc. are profit ensuring, less risky, transport cost free and employment friendly for the ethnic people. The project has helped to protect and expanded the resource bases and has contributed to increased both individual and community assets. All the economic activities have contributed to prevent and impeded dispossession of land, in cases communities have bought land and they have recovered some land.
5. As food is ensured and assets of the families are increasing, it has impact on repairing of houses or rebuilding of tin-roof houses. There were few houses with tin-roof previous to the project intervention and the majority of houses were with grass-roof. People are now found to convert grass-roof houses into tin-roof ones as this is not only providing higher security but also higher dignity and status.
6. One of the important impacts of the project is that the project gave an impetus to grow vegetable in the courtyards, fallow lands and in winter for commercial purpose to earn cash. This has resulted in lessened food expenditure of the ethnic people as well as increased their food options. Besides vegetable growing, peoples are now found increasingly to bring up livestock and poultry which led to increased production of milk and eggs. Previously, some of the families used to breed chicken and the number of cows and goats were few. The increased numbers of livestock have direct impact on, family earning, food intake and as a source of valuable nutritional needs.
7. Available cash for treatment, book for children and expenditure for burial rites and rituals is one of the direct benefits due to the project intervention. These types of impacts long term consequences to the well-being of the community as it will indirect, education and social dignity.
8. Previous to the project many community people have to migrate in other parts of the country for seasonal work. The project provided with food security support and created opportunity for work in the area helped to stop migration. The indirect social impact on family well being should not be undermined due to the ending of practice.

IMPACT ON HEALTH AND EDUCATION

As economic security and institutional basis was formed through the project it has worked as a factor for the community leaders to be engaged with people's representative and local government authorities for raising the issues of legal and entitlement rights. The leaders are in communication with Upazila level health and education service providers for the services entitled for the community people. The project increased the power to dialogue and negotiation with the government authorities and that have further impact the improvements of health and education conditions of the ethnic people. The people's representatives are more attentive to the community leaders which would not happen without the existence of their pro-active role.

Under the Rokkhagola the people are now taking initiatives to build sanitary toilets, promoting hygienic practice and sending patients to doctors, which was not in practice except few wealthy families. It could be said that the project has impact on the health practices of the ethnic communities who are targeted.

IMPACT ON GOVERNANCE AND LEADERSHIP

1. Rokkhagola has reestablished the self governing institutions traditionally existed in the ethnic villages by contributing build community organizations that are able to provide senses of membership to all the age groups and women by involving all of them in the community as general members of the village organization. They have formed governing and executive body and several issue based groups such as education, health, security etc. was a good strategy to accommodate all the members of the community. The project tried to ensure the participation of all including women in the leadership positions. This is proved to be fundamental for democratic participation of peoples in their social and political life. The impact of the institution building is clearly visible on the enhancement of leadership capacity as the committees are active to undertake economic, social and cultural activities. The formation of committees provided opportunity for community elders to play leadership role, and emerged as a social leaders. The increased capacity of fund management, handling of bank account and undertaking other economic activities are clearly indicating the enhanced leadership capacity. The reorganization of community institutions has impact of undertaking new form of social and cultural activities. The decision and implementation of annual festivals and supporting community in time of their needs, for example burial rites etc. is possible due to the functioning of the village organization.
2. One of the crucial impacts is evident in their monthly meeting agenda that they are engaged in dispute resolution, problem solving and dealing with community conflict management. Previously, the community people were dependent on local elite for their internal conflict management or dispute resolution. With the reorganization of community institution the ethnic people achieved the self reliance on self governance in internal dispute resolution and conflict handling.
3. One of the significant impacts of the community organization building is the creation of scope for the women to take part in the committees therefore, in decision making process, initiated and recognized an equal status of men and women that is challenging the patriarchal gender stereotype. Given the strong patriarchal context in Bangladesh, it is important that the project addressed the social discrimination and seclusion of women. It is interesting to note that the involvement of women in village institution is accepted by the neighboring villages that are relatively conservative. The position of women in Rokkhagola organization promoted and enhanced the leadership capacity of women leaders.
4. One of the vital impacts of the project is the increased unity among the villagers contributing to social harmony as well as asserting their identity in a collective manner. Without having the organization it would almost impossible to protect their cultural identity. Their experience of strength from united and collective efforts provided them with much needed self confidence and self esteem to be able to participate in local democratic process.

IMPACTS ON CULTURE AND HERITAGE

The activities of the village organizations under the Rokkhagola resulted in far reaching impacts on the culture and heritage of the ethnic population. One of the important changes through the project is the increased practice of own cultural festivals and rituals mentioned by the community. The collection of traditional instruments and revival of traditional music and cultural forms, especially organizing New Year's festival and other seasonal festivals are very important for protection and preservation of culture of the ethnic people. The project was able to generate interests for reflections and discussions on tradition and heritage of ethnic communities and values of those ethnic practices. The values of equality, cooperation, collectiveness, caring, sharing and symbiotic relation with nature is considered at the core of cultural practices. These are important humane values need more understanding and clarity for a true democratic society building. The project provided opportunity by creating space for such discussion relevant for other communities too. There are changes in the patterns of organizing and enjoying cultural festivals. Previously, only few relatively wealthier families could observe some of the festivals individually. The project intervention increased the types and number of festivals and cultural

occasions and the festivals are organized, participated and enjoyed by the whole community. There is a significant awareness and respect for own spiritual and religious identity. According to the community leaders the villagers are no more interested in changing religion, especially to Christianity. It seems that the changes in economic conditions coupled with new awareness on identity helped people to look for more spiritual content of the religion. The engagement and participation in various collective cultural activities and events contributed to reduction of drug abuse, alienation and related conflict and violence, and increased social harmony and mental health is recognized by the community people.

IMPACT ON WOMEN EMPOWERMENT

Participation in formal position in the village council by the women members in leadership position is a significant change in their traditional self governance system contributed to achieve a greater awareness on gender equality and a crucial challenge to patriarchal values and practices. The women members are now part of important decision making in all sphere of family, economic and social life.

There are changes due to project interventions directly and indirectly have impact on violence against women and in cases gender based violence. For example, dealing with conflict and resolute dispute within the villages reduced deprivation and abuse of women in local dispute resolution systems and presence of women position itself a qualitative change in dispute resolution practices at the rural areas. The issue of gender discrimination, violence against women and injustice is discussed in the meeting and a new level of awareness is in building in the community which has potentials to achieve greater impact on gender relation and gender based violence.

RELEVANCE, EFFICIENCY, EFFECTIVENESS AND SUSTAINABILITY OF THE PROJECT

Relevance:

The objectives of Rokkhagola food security project are clearly in line with the government's poverty reduction strategy and Food Security Strategy designed to enhance the development of the indigenous people in the country. To this end ethnic households are targeted and the project is running towards improving their socioeconomic condition. Analysis of the survey data and reviewing the Focus Groups interviews and the Key Informant interviews it is found that almost all the ethnic are very poor and their socioeconomic improvement requires effectively addressing their needs and provide supports accordingly. However, it should be mentioned that although they have many problems, the one which receive high concern is food insecurity. Under this project CCBVO has tried to enhance their capability for achieving food security. If food is secured, then these poor people can be made engaged to promote their own development. In that viewpoint this project was very much relevant for development. Analysis of the socioeconomic and demographic characteristics of the households in the area implied that they region was backward in many respects and the ethnic households income enough to ensure necessary food and other needs of the family members. During the project intervention many of the laggings were removed by acting under the Rokkhagola organization. Many positive impacts are seen in the ethnic households of the area which could not be achieved without the intervention of this project. Considering this the project was very much relevant for the region and also for CCBVO as it aimed to work for transformational development in the program area.

Efficiency and Effectiveness:

In the evaluation it is seen that most of the activities of the projects were performed with relatively better efficiency. In most cases, activities are implemented as per planned in the design. Discrepancy between plan implementation is seen only in few cases. In the case of existence of internal friction in the village, activities could not be implemented timely. In some cases activities were seen to be delayed started due to political crisis in the country. Project management is satisfactory on the average and reports on monitoring and evaluation are maintained properly. However, this project has few regular pay-roll staffs which can be considered as an in-built weakness of this project, and this disadvantaged the activities of this project many times. Interventions of CCBVO under its Rokkhagola project can be seen effective considering the outcomes of the activities. It is found that the activities have brought about positive outcomes in most of the cases. The effectiveness of the project are manifested by their

achieved food security, increased assets, higher income, motivation towards education and health related issues, attitudes to preservation of own culture and heritage etc and positives cross cutting outcomes. Compared to the annual report, 2013 evaluation indicators have shown that gradual improvement in different sectors has happened. Thus, most of the activities of this project proved to be effective in bringing about positive results. However, reports are found with regard to slow progress in some villages.

Sustainability:

Sustainability is a complex and intricate issue and requires critical analysis. It appears that the activities under the Rokkhagola has gained popularity and proved to be useful for food security and asset enhancement of the ethnic households in the study area. Therefore, people would continue the practices in their activities for their own sack. Possibility of gaining sustainability is also very high as a positive view in the villagers about the Rokkhagola is existing currently. All the village based organizations already raised fund through savings which they use for investment and employment generating purposes for the members. Therefore, the activities and the practices will sustain in the future. The Rokkhagola house which is build to unite them will also work as factor of sustainability of the organizations.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Findings

This final evaluation study has collected data on issues pertinent to the *Rokkhagola* village based food security project of CCBVO. Based on the results of the study, the following findings about the project are identified. The areas identified by this study will help guiding CCBVO activities to keep on the right track toward meeting the stated goals.

1. It is found that Rokkhagola project was well planned. The process of planning was participatory and it considered inbuilt approach to learn from the people and solve problems of the people in their own way. The people and resource mapping prior to the beginning of the project was properly done. Therefore, optimum results in terms of some satisfactory and tangible changes happened in the project area. It is worth to mention that CCBVO was not in a position to spent sufficient resources in relation to what is needed as per the goals of the project. Logistics support from the organization for the field level workers was found to be inadequate. This is why, supports could not be provided immediately when emergency need arises. However, it the devotion of the workers of CCBVO at all levels whose commitment to bring about changes in the lives of the endogenous people made the project a success.
2. The facilitation process explicitly showed the interests about traditional indigenous knowledge and implicitly provided the feeling that the community was given attention. Community knowledge was accepted and traditional knowledge was valued. The success in terms of community involvement and their ownership of the process including achieving community solidarity, cultural autonomy and economic self reliance to a great extent happened due to the authentic people oriented and participatory facilitation process. This has led to increase the self confidence of the endogenous people that it is possible for them to do whatever challenging for the betterment of their society. It is important to mention that the nature of the facilitation was the key factor for the impressive achievements of the project
3. It is found that the coordination and supervision of the staff was knowledge based. In every month the staff used to meet to report and plan for the next period. The orientation of the field workers was mainly from the coordination process. The supervision process was based on learning by doing approach and helpful for the staff to grow. However, there is lack of formal monitoring and evaluation at regular basis. Outcome based monitoring is weak and the number of field staffs to this purpose is also not adequate. A formal and improved monitoring system and adequate number of monitoring staffs could be more effective in achieving more outcomes.
4. The documentation system under this project was a little bit weak, especially, the learning from experiences of both the facilitators and the community was not systematically documented that could have been useful materials for participatory and people centered process. The concept of

knowledge management was less practiced in the project. The project could have generated and documented good practices, achievements and challenges. The valuable learning from the project could be reflected upon and compiled for wider circulation.

5. Rokkhagola project has become successful in achieving food security. The people of the project area has successfully reduced their food insecurity though their food saving and food transaction under the Rokkhagola organizations. It is found that around 95 percent families have taken rice assistance from the Rokkhagola food bank. Now they can take food three times a day. However, this food security is achieved in a narrower sense. Because, food security is achieved in terms of rice only. It is found that they are still in a far way to ensure nutritious food necessary to live a healthy life. Food rights and nutrition rights are still not perceived properly by these people. The daily food intake taken by the ethnic people are highly imbalanced and inadequate as far as nutrition is concerned.
6. It is found from the survey that CCBVO's Rokkhagola project has achieved its overall objective of food security. As food security is achieved, has been contributing to other progresses as well. CCBVO's basic conception is that if food security is achieved, then it facilitates to take initiatives for development of other aspects of ethnic people's lives. That is why the present situation insists on going for new interventions towards ensuring food utilization as well as earning additional income by the families.
7. *Rokkhagola* is a very popular project considering the views of the people at the local level. People have no misunderstanding or misconception about the activities of the project. The impacts of the project activities on the ethnic people are tremendous – food security ensured, savings in cash and kind increased, women became very smart, outspoken, peoples' participation in community activities increased and their feeling about conserving their own culture and tradition increased. Specially, the age long problem of food crisis of the ethnic people has been solved by the Rokkhagola organization, although provision of quality food still remains as a concern. One cannot think about such changes happened in the ethnic people in such a very short time. The spill-over effects of this are also visible in the intervention areas as early marriage, child labor etc. have been decreased and motivation towards child education, health, sanitation etc. increased. However, women are still lagging behind in many respects. Their active participation in activities that could lead to women empowerment and leadership development is found very low. Women's participation in family decision making is also found very low.
8. Activities and achievements under the Rokkhagola village based organization has created impacts in the society in wider environment as the visual improvements of the living conditions in the project villages have created attraction to the other villages. This has created hope that it is possible to take the village development in their own hands and inspired them to form their own Rokkhagola organizations. The achievements so far has created confidence and pride in them and this is working to create a situation so that now they can get respect from their Bengali neighbors. Furthermore, the project has sensitized the local government and administration to the needs of the ethnic communities in general. However, the capability of the village organizations is found very weak in the area of networking with social and government organizations. In this connection, it is also observed that the staffs of CCBVO are also lacking enough capability to help the village organizations in this regard. Unless improved capacity building towards networking is done, social and government organizations cannot be made work for the indigenous people.
9. It is found from the survey as well as from the FGDs that the village organizations by this time has raised significant amount of fund. It is also reported that some of the organizations have invested part of the accumulated savings for their benefit. But in cases of most of the villages the savings remained idle. CCBVO also did not chalk out any plan as to how this savings can be used properly in a risk less way.
10. It is found from the sample survey as well as from the FGDs that in and around the indigenous villages there is a lot of natural resources such as khas land, ponds, water bodies etc. which are mostly occupied by local powerful elites. Ethnic people cannot use water from these ponds for their day use. Even the graveyards of the ethnic people have also been grabbed by adjacent landholders. Making access of the ethnic people to these resources would result in higher welfare of these people.

11. It is found that ethnic people face many problems to purchase their daily necessities from general market setting dominated by non-ethnic communities. Similarly, they face difficulties in selling whatever they produce locally. There is a demand from the part of the ethnic people that if a market system could be introduced for them, then they could perform their daily transactions without getting cheated.
12. Rokkhagola food security model is operating only in 26 villages. But there are many ethnic villages in Rajshahi District where food security problem exists acutely and many people reported that observing the success of the present 26 villages, people of other villages also eagerly expect Rokkhagola organizations to be formed in their villages. In Godagari Upazila there are 112 ethnic villages as well. It is found that as CCBVO is not in a position to include other villages, some have voluntarily formed Rokkhagola organization and started practicing food saving and transaction. But they lack proper support and techniques in running their organizations and became unable to run their activities.
13. Although it is found that ethnic people are becoming aware about observing their festivals and occasions increasingly, there still remains more scope of raising awareness about the need for conserving their culture and heritage as well as the ways of doing that. It is found that the cultural committees of the Rokkhagola organization are not much strong to promote ethnic culture and traditions to wider extent. There is an objective of promoting existing cultural centre to extend wider cooperation and developing skills of the individual cultural groups in the villages. However, it is not yet build.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the evaluation following recommendations are given for further improvement of the project activities:

- 1) Although CCBVO has its own monitoring system on all of its ongoing projects, the monitoring is found insufficient in terms of assessing the progress towards the achievement of outcome based targets. CCBVO needs to device out a formal and improved monitoring system which will monitor the use of the project outputs towards the benefit of the ethnic people and thus assess the progress at outcome level.
- 2) It is found from the study that CCBVO has been lacking proper management of knowledge in terms of both having weakness in capacity building of its staffs and also in the area of monitoring of its activities. The documentation of findings and experiences, and recording and sharing of these findings and experiences is also not strong. This can be developed and improved by arranging training and workshop sessions on the above aspects. Therefore, CCBVO must take proper initiative to its institutional capacity building as well as the capacity building of its staffs urgently in order to ensure proper implementation of its ongoing and future projects.
- 3) Food security is achieved in narrower sense as ethnic people do not have enough ability to get nutritious food necessary to live a healthy life. Moreover, the issue of food rights and the issue of nutrition rights were also not achieved. Therefore, initiatives should be taken by CCBVO with introducing a new program under the existing project, to promote food rights as well as the provision of nutrition for a better and healthy next generation.
- 4) CCBVO has been working with the conception that if food security is achieved, then it facilitates to take initiatives for development of other aspects of ethnic people's lives. Thus, the success achieved by the Rokkhagola project requires CCBVO to device out further plans for promoting other aspects of development of the lives and livelihoods of the ethnic population. To this end CCBVO needs to mobilize and allocate additional resources so as to support the field level activities towards the targets. It is time that the CCBVO can intervene to promote earnings of the indigenous people by growing vegetable, rearing cattle and raising poultry for increasing their family income.
- 5) It is recognized that the activities and practices under the Rokkhagola village based organizations resulted in tremendous development in the women folk of the ethnic communities. However, due to patriarchal values women still are lagging behind and taking them out from all sorts of bondage is not still completed. This requires more initiatives to develop leadership in the women. Gender sensitized program within the framework of promoting women leadership will be useful in this

regard. To this end a sub-committee under the Rokkhagola organization can be formed to promote empowerment of women at societal and familial levels. Therefore, CCBVO should take new action plans in this light to bring about further development of the ethnic women of the intervention area.

- 6) Although it is found that the project has sensitized the local government and administration to the needs of the ethnic communities in general, the capability of the village organizations however, is found very weak and the staffs of CCBVO are also lacking enough capability in networking the village organizations with social and government organizations. Therefore, initiatives should be taken to increase such capabilities of the village organizations through negotiating with some government and NGOs who can provide technical help in this regard. Moreover, proper training should also be given to the CCBVO staffs as well as the village organizers so that their ability increases in creating and maintaining network with the social and government organizations towards fulfilling the needs of the ethnic people.
- 7) Since ethnic people are basically introvert and risk averters by nature, sometimes they do not dare to invest their saving money for their benefit. Therefore, CCBVO can start new interventions so that all village organizations can find some common modalities to invest this money. To this end, CCBVO can device out and suggest some economically viable areas of investment which can increase employment of the ethnic people, at the same time the risk of incurring loss in the investment is lessened. Even, new assignments targeting to traditional off-farm based initiatives can be taken by CCBVO.
- 8) Ethnic people by tradition lead their livelihood based on natural resources. Traditionally, their skills are only developed centering on agriculture and natural resource based activities. But due to losing land ownership gradually, they are facing unemployment problem as they are not habitual to do works other than agriculture and similar activities. It is found that there are still some lands (khas land), and ponds and water bodies under government ownership. But, ethnic people are deprived of using these local natural resources to their benefit as these are owned and controlled by others. It is learnt that appropriate training on fish culture given to the ethnic people, would enable them to be competitive in getting access to these type of local natural resources. So, new initiatives can be taken so that use of these natural resources can be made to good and beneficial use of the ethnic population.
- 9) As the ethnic people face many problems to purchasing selling commodities in general markets there is a demand that if a market system could be introduced for them then they could perform their daily transactions without getting cheated. Thus, an assignment of promoting a market networking among the ethnic peoples and villages may be taken with the assistance of CCBVO that would maximize their personal and social welfare. Therefore, necessary steps should be taken to establish market networking among them. For this purpose, additional program can be taken under the Rokkhagola project.
- 10) Like the 26 villages under the Rokkhagola project, many other villages surrounding the project area inhabited by ethnic population face food insecurity problems and people of those villages also want the operation of Rokkhagola in their villages. In this situation, CCBVO should expand their activities in more villages inhabited by the ethnic population. As this is a successful project, its replication to the case of other villages would certainly bring about greater social welfare of the ethnic communities.
- 11) Although Rokkhagola activities are being operated towards promoting the culture and heritage of the ethnic population, progress is very slow. Under Rokkhagola's system of activities, the organization generally does not enforce the ethnic people to observe and conserve their culture and heritage mandatorily, except for some day observations. Under the Rokkhagola, people are only encouraged to observe social and religious festivals. But due to poverty and lack of enough awareness many people do not give proper emphasis on these aspects. Therefore, CCBVO can start to provide technical skills in this respect which are directly linked to the culture, customs, values and heritage of the indigenous people. Moreover, the cultural committee of the Rokkhagola organization should be made stronger through building linkage with government run ethnic cultural academy.

CONCLUSION

Analyses based on household survey, focus group discussion and key informant interview revealed that 'Rokkhagola Project' under the CCBVO is a success story, although in some cases the progress is found to be very slow. As per CCBVO's overall development goal, this type of project can be treated as an opportunity for improving strategies and ways in implementing the development programs for the ethnic people. It is seen that the Rokkhagola project has been implemented nicely as per the plan. Based on the findings of the final evaluation, recommendations are made for further action. The recommendations will help guide the donor agency 'Bread for the World' as well as the CCBVO in formulating policy towards targeting areas for intervention and implementation. Further, it is observed and reported that there are many scope to work for the ethnic people those are really victim culturally and socially, they need institutional support to create social and political security. There are numbers of ethnic people including dalit are living in these areas mostly scattered, distressed and oppressed by the surrounding situation, however the government of Bangladesh recognizes their rights to protect their culture, heritage ritual and beliefs as well.

Annexure

Table 4: Age Distribution of the Population		
Age	Total population	Percentage total population
0 to 5 years	651	11.7
6 -10 years	974	16.5
11-15	957	16.2
16-30	1235	22.2
31-45	952	17.1
46-60	623	13.2
60+	173	3.1
Total	5665 (1105 Households)	100
Dependency Ratio: 475		

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 4A: Age Distribution of the Population in the sample families		
Age	Total Population	Percentage Total Population
0 to 5 years	59	8.9
6 -10 years	72	13.3
11-15	85	14.2
16-30	129	24.8
31-45	101	18.1
46-60	72	12.2
60+	23	4.2
Total	541 (104 Households)	100
Dependency ratio: 461		

Source: Sample survey

Table 5: Education of the Total Population		
Level of Education	Total	% of Total
Minor children	618	10.9
Illiterate	636	11.2
Can sign Only	1283	22.6
Primary (1 to 5 Years)	1510	26.7
Secondary (6 to 9 Complete)	1342	23.7
SSC Pass	131	2.3
HSC Pass	106	1.9
Graduation and above	39	0.7
Total	5665	100

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 5A: Educational Qualification of the Household heads		
Level of Education	No of respondents	% of respondents
Illiterate	18	17.3
Can sign Only	42	40.4
Primary (1 to 5 years)	26	25.0
Secondary (6 to 9 complete)	12	11.5
S.S.C Pass	3	2.9
H.H.C Pass	2	1.9
Graduation and above	1	0.99
Total	104	100.00

Source: Sample survey

Table 6: Literacy Rate of Population	
Items	Rate (%)
Age 6 years and above	61.75
Net primary enrolment rate (age 6 to 11)	92.2
Gross Enrolment rate (6 to 24)	79.75
Male	44.70
Female	35.05
Drop out from primary and secondary schools	13.5
Total Population: 5665	

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 7: Reasons for Dropout from School according to the Respondents		
Reasons for drop-out	No of Respondents	Opinions (%)
Cannot understand Bengali language at the beginning	5	4.9
Cannot understand school lessons (Bengali, English, Arithmetic)	20	19.3
Child marriage	5	4.5
Discrimination against ethnic children	2	1.9
Financial problem of parents	57	55.0
Child labour	6	5.8
Helping parents in their work	63	60.4
Total Respondent: 104		100%

Source: Sample survey

Table 8: Average Monthly Income of respondent Households				
Income and Expenditure	Year		Maximum	Minimum
	2013	2014		
Average Monthly Income (Tk.)	3493.88	4185.74	8000.00	2000
Average Monthly Expenditure (Tk.)	3643.88	3986.22	7750.00	2200
Total respondents: 104				

Source: Sample survey

Table 9: Occupation of the Household Heads		
Name of Occupation	Households	%
Marginal farmer	16	15.4
Marginal farmer and farm labour	17	16.4
Farm labor only	58	55.8
Earthen work related labor	2	1.9
Rickshaw/Van puller	1	0.9
Job in private and public offices	2	1.9
Others (small business, work outside village etc.)	8	7.7
Total	104	100
Average number of earners per household		2.42

Source: Sample survey

Table 10: Land Assets of Rokkhagola Households		
Types of Land Ownership	Number of Households	%
No Cultivable land	744	67.3
No Homestead	338	30.5
Only cultivable land	229	20.7
Only homestead	635	57.5
Homestead and cultivable land	132	12.0
Total households: 1105		

Source: CCBVO documents

Table10 A: Land Assets of Respondents		
Types of land ownership	Number of households	% of households
No cultivable land	68	65.2
No homestead	33	33.5
Only cultivable land	24	22.7
Only homestead	59	56.5
Homestead and cultivable land	13	12.1
Total Respondent households: 104		

Source: Sample survey

Total 10 B: Average Size of Land and Homestead		
Types of land	2013	2014
Average land per family (percentile)	13.16	13.16
Average size of homestead (percentile)	7.11	7.11
Average size of cultivable land and others land (percentile)	14.72	14.72
Total Respondents: 104		

Source: Sample survey

Table 11: Other Assets of the Respondents	
Items asset	% of Respondents
Cycle	92.5
Motor cycle	6.0
TV/radio/cassette player	70.0
Rickshaw/van	1.2
Power tiller	12.5
Mobile phone	62.5
Total respondents: 104	

Source: Sample survey

Table12 : Livestock and Poultry Rearing by Respondent Families		
Description	Number of households	% of households
Rearing hens and duck	62	61
Rearing cows	83	80
Rearing goat/Sheep	67	64
Fish culture	17	16
Tree planted in the homestead	64	62
Total Respondents :104		

Source: Sample survey

Table 13: Percentage of Respondent Households Grow Vegetable and have Trees in the Homestead		
	Number of Families	% total Families
Grow Vegetable at Homestead	83	80
Tree planted in the homestead	64	62
Total Respondents :104		

Source: Sample survey

Table14: Condition of Houses of Ethnic Households	
Condition of Houses	%
Pucca house	0.0
Pucca wall and tin shade	1.9
Mud wall and tin shade	92.3
Mud wall and grass shade	3.8
Straw and thatch	1.9
Total	100

Source: Sample survey

Table 15: Problems Face by the People of the Endogenous Community	
Problems	Opinion of respondent (%)
Discrimination in access to hotel, restaurant, saloon, tea stall etc.	76.3
Not allowed to take meal in Bangalee houses	37.4
Physical torture	47.5
Mental torture	47.5
Threat of eviction homestead	23.8
Torture of women	46.3
Total respondents: 104	

Source: Sample survey

Table 17: Duration of Membership by Families in Rokkhagola Organization		
Duration	Number of Households	% of households
One year	36	3.3
Two year	147	13.3
Three year	283	25.6
Four year	442	41.8
Five year	113	10.2
Six and above	64	5.8
Total	1105	100

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 19: Regularities of Meeting of Rokkhagola Organization		
Type of meeting	Yes (%)	No (%)
General meeting holds regularly	92	8
Executive committee meeting	100	0
Health committee meeting	Occasionally when needed	
Education committee meeting	2/3 times in a year	
Security committee meeting	Occasionally when needed	
Cultural committee meeting	4/5 times (before annual gathering and major festivals)	

Source: Sample survey

Table 20: Issues discussed in the general and executive committee meetings	
Issue	% of respondents
Weekly saving	100
Transaction of assistance	100
Bank deposit related	82.6
Investment of deposited resources	24.03
Village disputes	72.1
Child marriage	14.4
Education	53.8
Health and sanitation	62.5
Security of villagers from outside problems	24.03
Khas land /Khas pond	21.2
Family violence	16.3
Social and religious events	40.4
Marriage and funeral	50.0
Problems created by outsiders	7.7
Total Respondents: 104	

Source: Sample survey

Table 21: Rokkhagola Savings pattern	
Saving Items	% of total respondents
Saving of rice (0.5 kg. per week)	98.5
Saving of rice (1 kg. per week)	3.5
Saving of paddy (5 kg. per season)	100
Saving money for making latrine	8.5

Source: Sample survey

Table 23 : Deposit Situation Under Rokkhagola		
Deposit Items	Year	
	2013	2014
Total amount of rice save in 26 Rokkhagola (Kg.)	96456.5	125389.5
Average amount of saved rice per Rokkhagola (kg.)	379.8	4822.6
Per family saving of rice (Kg.)	--	113.47
Total amount of paddy saved in 26 Rokkhagola (Kg.)	16520	20626
Average amount of paddy save per Rokkhagola	635.38	793.3
Per family saving of paddy (kg.)	--	18.67
Total amount of money deposit in banks (Tk.)	--	768, 115
Total cash in hand (Tk)	--	172,693

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 24: Regularity of savings by Rokkhagola member households		
Items	Number of households	% of total families
Number of families deposit weekly saving of rice in due date	951	86.1
Number of families deposits weekly saving of rice not in due date but in next week	88	7.9
Cannot deposit in due time but within one month	44	4.0
Deposit after one month	22	2.0
Deposit paddy in due time	1105	100
Total	1105	100%

Source: CCBVO documents and sample survey

Table 25: Assistance Taken by Respondents from Rokkhagola		
Type of Assistance	Number of households	% of households
Rice	1017	92.03
Paddy	9	0.01
Money	109	9.9
Total Households: 1105		

Source: CCBVO documents

Table 26: Number of Meals Taken by Respondents Families Per Day	
Number of meal per day	% of families
One	0.0
Two	22.3
Three	81.7

Source: Sample survey

Table 27: Types of Diseases Respondent Family Members in last One Year	
Member suffered from diseases in the last year (% Family)	93%
Does not suffer from disease in the last year (% Family)	7%
Cold/fever (% Family)	88.1
Skin disease (% Family)	33.1
Dysentery (% Family)	67.8
Diarrhoea (% Family)	71.2
Jaundice (% Family)	45.5
Gastric (% Family)	60.8
Others (% Family)	9.9

Source: Sample survey

Table 28: Sources of Treatment Taken by the Respondents	
Type of Health Centre	% of respondent
Medical hospital	34.3
Upazila health complex	17.6
Private hospital/clinic	10.7
Drug store/Pharmacy	37.7
Village Physician	74.5
Homio Doctor	11.0
Traditional Treatment	31.4

Source: Sample survey

Table 29: Ethnic People go to Union Parishad	
Taken service	%
Yes	94%
No	6%

Number of Households: 104

Source: Sample survey

Table 31: Awareness about Ethnic culture and heritage	
Description of Issues	% of respondents
Many of the traditional cultural activities are in extinction	90
Many of the traditional foods are not eaten/ not available	72

Source: Sample survey

Table 32: Average Number of User Households of a Tube well	
Year	Average Families Per Tube well
2013	15.54
2014	14.98

Source: Sample survey

Table 33: participation of women in family decision making		
Aspects	Yes (%)	No (%)
Education of children	65	35
Purchasing assets	42	58
Selling of crops/cattle/ poultry	54	46
Building and repairing house	45	55
Buying utensils	90	10
Choice of crops in land	25	75
Marriage of children	40	60
Organizing family occasions and inviting others	35	65

FGD FINDINGS

To find out the in depth information FGD was conducted with 10 different focus groups those who were involved with Rokkhagola Project. The size of these focus groups was 10 to 14 participants of homogeneous socioeconomic status. Total participant of 10 FGD group was 140. 55% of the participants were female and rests 45% were male. Age of the participants was ranging from 21 to 55 years. It has been found that most of the participants were low educated, some of the participant can sign only and few participants educational qualification were found SSC to BA.

FG-1 Gordawing	FG-2	FG-3 Golai	FG-4 Beldanga and Nimkuri	FG-5 Dangpara	FG-6 Mulkydawing and Pathorghata	FG-7 Gunigram, Farshapara and Shahanapara	FG-8 Muralipur, Gogram, Madhaipur, Agalpur, Sakura	FG-9 Edurpurpur, Choitonnapur, Kamlapur Bilpara,	FG-10 Ninghutu, Adarshogram and Gonakardawin
Rokkhagola organization is running effectively and meetings held in due time every month	Rokkhagola organization arrange two meetings per month and they discuss their problems related to the organization and related to their others socio-economic problems.	Rokkhagola organization is working without facing any problems. Organization conducts at least two meeting per month. However, it arrange more than two meetings if the any member fall on problems and inform it to the organization.	Rokkhagola organization organize general meeting and management committee meetings. In meeting, problems and prospects of the organization are discussed.	Rokkhagola organization is working smoothly and meetings held regularly per month.	Rokkhagola organization conduct three of four meetings per month, among them two are monthly meetings and others are additional meetings related to daily life.	Rokkhagola organization is completely effective .It arrange general committee meeting and management committee meeting per month.	Rokkhagola organization is running effectively and meetings held in due time every month	Rokkhagola organization arrange two meetings per month to discuss about condition of the organization	Rokkhagola organization is running effectively and meetings held in due time every month
All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form	All decisions taken in meeting are kept in written form
5 out of 9 members are women of the management committee.	Management committee consists of 9 members among them 3 are women and 6 are men.	There are total 7 members in management committee among them 4 are women and three are men.	5 out of 9 members are women of the management committee.	Both male and female members have in management committee. Out of total 11 members 5 female.	4 out of 9 members are women of the management committee.	Management committee consists of 4 female and 5 male members.	Among total 11 members of management committee 4 women .		

FG-1 Gordawing	FG-2	FG-3 Golai	FG-4 Beldanga and Nimkuri	FG-5 Dangpara	FG-6 Mulkydawing and Pathorghata	FG-7 Gunigram, Farshapara and Shahanapara	FG-8 Muralipur, Gogram, Madhaipur, Agalpur, Sakura	FG-9 Edurpurpur, Choitonnapur, Kamlapur Bilpara,	FG-10 Ninghutu, Adarshogram and Gonakardawin
60% members of the Rokkhagola organization actively participate in the activities of the organization.	70% members of Rokkhagola organization participate in different activities associated the organization from their own motivation.	90% members of the Rokkhagola organization participate regularly in the activities of the organization.	75% members of Rokkhagola organization attend in different activities if they are informed.	There are some activities of Rokkhagola organization which is implemented be the regular participation of about 75% members of the organization.	88% members of the Rokkhagola organization actively participate in the activities of the organization.	Different activities of Rokkhagola organization is accomplished with active and direct participation of around 85% members of the organization.	Rokkhagola activities are arranged by the active participation of 84% members of the organization.	75% members of the Rokkhagola organization actively participate in the activities of the organization.	80% members of the Rokkhagola organization actively participate in the activities of the organization.
100% members save rice and paddy in due time.	100% members save rice in due time and 95% paddy	All members of Rokkhagola organization cannot save due time. However, 97% members save rice and paddy in due time.	Members of Rokkhagola save 0.5 Kg. of rice per week and 5 Kg. of paddy per season. Sometimes all members cannot save right time. 95% members save rice and paddy in due time.	Due to some problems some members fail to save rice in due time . However, 85% members save rice in due time and 100% members save paddy in due time.	Rokkhagola organization deposits 0.5 Kg. rice per week from 85% of members.	86% members save rice and paddy in due time.	The members of Rokkhagola face no problems to save rice and paddy and 100% members save rice and paddy in right time.	75 % members save rice and paddy in due time.	90% members save rice and paddy in due time.
They receive food assistance from Rokkhagola and repay it within three or four months. They ensure 100% food assistance and repayment.	In lean season they do not have work and therefore they take food assistance from Rokkhagola and repay in due time. Generally, 100% food assistance are ensured and repayment also ensured.	Most of them are agricultural labour. In off season they find no work and have to starve with family members. However, at that time they take food assistance from Rokkhagola and all members receive food assistance.	All have taken food assistance and repaid at right time.	100% member receive food assistance and repay it at right time but all cannot repay in due time.	Rokkhagola ensures food assistance and they do not have to face any problem to receive it.	100% food assistance and repayment are ensured.	They can take food assistance from Rokkhagola when they fall on food shortage. They repay it after three or four months.	100% food assistance and repayment are ensured.	100% food assistance and repayment are ensured.

FG-1 Gordawing	FG-2	FG-3 Golai	FG-4 Beldanga and Nimkuri	FG-5 Dangpara	FG-6 Mulkydawing and Pathorghata	FG-7 Gunigram, Farshapara and Shahanapara	FG-8 Muralipur, Gogram, Madhaipur, Agalpur, Sakura	FG-9 Edurpurpur, Choitonnapur, Kamlapur Bilpara,	FG-10 Ninghutu, Adarshogram and Gonakardawin
30% families have homestead gardens.	60% families have homestead gardens.	75% families have homestead gardens.	80% families have homestead gardens.	65% families have homestead gardens.	85% families have homestead gardens.	75% families have homestead gardens.	75% families have homestead gardens.	85% families have homestead gardens.	87% families have homestead gardens.
80% people take services from govt. health centre/ hospital	75% people receive services from govt. health centre/ hospital	60% people go to hospital and government health centre to receive services from there.	When ethnic people become sick they go to upazila level government hospital and union level community clinic to take treatment. 63% people take treatment from govt. health centre/ hospital	75% people are take services from govt. health centre/ hospital when they become ill.	65% people receive treatment and other services from zila and upazila level govt. health centre/ hospital	55% people go to take services from govt. health centre/ hospital	60% people take treatment and health related services from govt. health centre/ hospital	50% people take services from govt. health centre/ hospital	80% people take services from govt. health centre/ hospital
45% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	50% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	35% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	30% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	35% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	40% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	30% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	40% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	43% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office	45% people take services from upazila Parishad, union Parishad and land office
2.4% people receive service of safety net programme.	Government provides safety net services to poor and vulnerable people. About 3% people receive service of safety net programme.	Safety net programme of government provides services to only 3.5% people.	The people who are helpless get services from safety net program provided by government. Only t 3% people receive services from the programme.	3.4% people who cannot afford their basic needs by their income get services of safety net programme.	5% people get service of safety net programme.	Safety net programme provides adult allowance, food relief etc. to only 2% people.	6% people receive service of safety net programme.	They receive food assistance, adult allowance etc of safety net programme.	They receive no services of safety net program.

FG-1 Gordawing	FG-2	FG-3 Golai	FG-4 Beldanga and Nimkuri	FG-5 Dangpara	FG-6 Mulkydawing and Pathorghata	FG-7 Gunigram, Farshapara and Shahanapara	FG-8 Muralipur, Gogram, Madhaipur, Agalpur, Sakura	FG-9 Edurpurpur, Choitonnapur, Kamlapur Bilpara,	FG-10 Ninghutu, Adarshogram and Gonakardawin
50% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	75% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	80% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	60% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	75% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	75% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	65% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	85% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	75% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.	80% enrolment increased of children at govt. primary school.
They have own culture and some festivals related to their culture. 90% of them observe their socio-cultural festivals.	95% people observe their own socio-cultural festivals.	They observe their own social and cultural festivals in different occasions in the presence of about 97% of total population of their area.	All people do not take part in social and cultural festivals. According to them about 90% people take part in their social and cultural festivals.	Almost all people join in festivals when they observe. They think around 99% people join in their socio-cultural festivals.	100% people take part in festivals that are arranged in their social and cultural occasions.	They try to observe their own festival collectively and almost 95% people attend in festivals when they observed it socially.	95% people observe their socio-cultural festivals.	All people are aware about their social and cultural festivals and 96% people observe them regularly.	90% people observe their socio-cultural festivals.
People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.	People are aware to preserve their own culture.
64% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	100% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	88.5% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	64% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	100% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	88.5% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	64% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	64% % families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	88.5% families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola	81% % families of this village are the members of Rokkhagola
100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school	100% families send their children to school

FG-1 Gordawing	FG-2	FG-3 Golai	FG-4 Beldanga and Nimkuri	FG-5 Dangpara	FG-6 Mulkydawing and Pathorghata	FG-7 Gunigram, Farshapara and Shahanapara	FG-8 Muralipur, Gogram, Madhaipur, Agalpur, Sakura	FG-9 Edurpurpur, Choitonnapur, Kamlapur Bilpara,	FG-10 Ninghutu, Adarshogram and Gonakardawin
They do not have any own land to build house. Therefore, they build up their houses on khas land. They told that 100% families in their area live on khas land.	85% families live on khas land	Few of them have a small piece of land that they use as homestead. However, 75% families of them live on khas land.	Khas land are generally distributed to the people who are land less. 85% families in their area live on khas land but they are not the owner of those land.	80% families live on khas land.	They think that 75% families in their area live on khas land and they do not have the ownership of the land where they live.	In this area around 85% families live on khas land	90% families live on khas land	All of them have no land and therefore, 100% families in the area live on khas land	100% families live on khas land
They grow vegetables at their homestead to meet the requirement of it. They told that 100% families in their area grow vegetables at homestead.	They do not have any land to grow vegetables. Some have homestead but have not enough space to grow vegetables. Therefore, 85% families in their region grow vegetables at homestead.	90% families grow vegetables at homestead	They understand the necessity of growing vegetables at homestead and about 95% families practice it at their homestead.	Around 85% families grow vegetables at homestead	All families in their area do not grow vegetables. They think that 75% families grow vegetables at homestead	90% families grow vegetables at homestead	They have to buy vegetables from market if they do not grow them at home. Therefore, almost 97% families grow vegetables at their homestead	95% families grow vegetables at homestead	90% families grow vegetables at homestead
100% families rare hens and ducks	95% families rare hens and ducks	97% families rare hens and ducks	93% families rare hens and ducks	95% families rare hens and ducks	98% families rare hens and ducks	95% families rare hens and ducks	95% families rare hens and ducks	96% families rare hens and ducks	93% families rare hens and ducks
90% families rare cows and goats	85% families rare cows and goats	83% families rare cows and goats	90% families rare cows and goats	80% families rare cows and goats	75% families rare cows and goats	80% families rare cows and goats	75% families rare cows and goats	80% families rare cows and goats	85% families rare cows and goats